

MINUTES OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL PUBLIC HEARING FOR PROPOSED EXPANSION IN EXISTING UNIT OF COLD ROLLED COILS & SHEETS (FROM 2,10,000.0 TPA TO 3,00,000.0 TPA), HOT ROLLED PICKLED SKIN PASS COILS (FROM 90,000.0 TPA TO 1,50,000.0 TPA) & ADDITION OF NEW FACILITY FOR HOT ROLLED PICKLED GALVANIZED COILS (8,20,000.0 TPA) AT PLOT NO. S-76, MIDC TARAPUR INDUSTRIAL AREA, POST - BOISAR, TALUKA & DISTRICT - PALGHAR, MAHARASHTRA (401 506) BY PROJECT PROPONENT M/S TATA STEEL LIMITED. CRC WEST

The Environment Public Hearing for proposed expansion in existing unit of Cold Rolled Coils & Sheets (From 2,10,000.0 TPA to 3,00,000.0 TPA), Hot Rolled Pickled Skin Pass Coils (From 90,000.0 TPA to 1,50,000.0 TPA) & addition of new facility for Hot Rolled Pickled Galvanized Coils (8,20,000.0 TPA) at Plot No.S-76, MIDC, Tarapur Industrial Area, Post -Boisar, Taluka & District - Palghar, Maharashtra (401 506)

by Project Proponent M/s Tata Steel Limited, CRC West was conducted on Wednesday, the 11th January, 2023 at 11.00 a.m at project site- Plot No.S-76, MIDC, Tarapur Industrial Area, Tarapur, Taluka & District - Palghar, Maharashtra (401 506).

Shri Prashant Gaikwad, Sub Regional Officer-Tarapur-1, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Tarapur and Convener of the Environment Public Hearing Committee welcomed Shri Balasahb Kolekar, Additional District Magistrate, Palghar and Chairman of the Environment Public Hearing Committee; Shri Ravindra Andhale, Regional Officer, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Thane and Member of the Environment Public Hearing Committee; and local people/participants who were present and with permission of Chairman, Environment Public Hearing Committee started the proceedings.

Convener, Environment Public Hearing Committee informed that as per the Environment Impact Assessment (EIA) Notification of Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Govt. of India, (i.e. MoEF & CC, GoI) dated 14th September, 2006 as amended on 1st December, 2009, it is mandatory to conduct prior public consultation to certain projects which are covered in the schedule of the said Notification.

He informed that Maharashtra Pollution Control Board was in receipt of application from Project Proponent M/s Tata Steel Limited, CRC West for their

proposed expansion in existing unit of Cold Rolled Coils & Sheets (From 2,10,000.0 TPA to 3,00,000.0 TPA), Hot Rolled Pickled Skin Pass Coils (From 90,000.0 TPA to 1,50,000.0 TPA) & addition of new facility for Hot Rolled Pickled Galvanized Coils (8,20,000.0 TPA) at Plot No.S-76, MIDC, Tarapur Industrial Area, Post -Boisar, Taluka & District -Palghar, Maharashtra (401 506).

Convener further informed as per EIA Notification, 2006 the category of project falls under Category B-1 schedule 3 (a) which requires to obtain prior Environmental Clearance from the SEIAA - (State Environment Impact Assessment Authority) Environment & Climate Change Department, Govt of Maharashtra, Mumbai for which prior environmental consultation is mandatory.

Convener informed that the aim of conducting prior public consultation is to make aware, local people who can be participant in the hearing and they should know the developmental activities and Environment Management Plan of the unit.

Project Proponent had submitted online prescribed application alongwith pre-feasibility report to the, Ministry of Environment & Climate Change, Govt. of Maharashtra, Mumbai and it has been considered and given amended ToR .

After sanction of District Collector, Palghar to conduct the Physical Environment Public Hearing on Wednesday, the 11th January, 2023 at 11.00 a.m. and as per the Notification dated 14-09-2006 issued by Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Govt. of India, (MoEF & CC, Gol), New Delhi and subsequent amendment on 01-12-2019, Member Secretary, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Mumbai has constituted Public Hearing Panel vide Board's Office Order No. E- 98 of 2022 under letter no. BO/JD (WPC)/PH/B- 221209 FTS-0243 dated 09/12/2022 :-

- 1) District Magistrate-Palghar
or his representative not below
the rank of an Additional District
Magistrate

Chairman

- 2) Representative of Maharashtra
Pollution Control Board, -
Regional Officer – Thane,
Maharashtra Pollution Control Board,
Thane

Member

- 3) Sub Regional Officer-Tarapur-1,
Maharashtra Pollution Control Board,
Tarapur

Convener

As per said Notification, 30 days' advance public notice was published by Sub Regional Officer, Tarapur-1, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Tarapur in the Local Newspaper in Daily Lokmat for Marathi and in National Newspaper daily Times of India for English on 01st December, 2022. The public were appealed to send their suggestions, views, doubts or objections regarding the proposed unit.

Also copy of EIA report and executive summery were made available in Marathi and in English at various notified Government offices –

- 1) Hon'ble District Collector, Palghar;Collector Office Palghar, Tal & Dist-Palghar;
- 2) Chief Executive Officer, Zilla Parishad Office, Palghar;
- 3) The Director, Ministry of Environment & Climate Change Government of Maharashtra, 15th Floor, New Administrative Building, Opp. Mantralaya, Mumbai;
- 4) Joint Director (WPC), Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Head Office, Mumbai;
- 5) Tahsildar, Tahsil Office -Palghar , Dist – Palghar;
- 6) Gram Sevak, Gram Panchayat Office - Kolwade, Taluka & District - Palghar;
- 7) Regional Officer,Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Thane;
- 8) Sub Regional Officer, Tarapur-1, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Tarapur;
- 9) Website of Maharashtra Pollution Control Board;

This is to inform that on day of public hearing one representation is received by the Sub Regional Office, Tarapur-1, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board.

Convener informed that an opportunity is given to all participants to raise any doubts, suggestions, or objections regarding the proposed project in environmental angle, which can be submitted by orally or in writing also.

Convener asserted that this Committee is only for recording public opinion, suggestions, objections and has no right to approve, reject or recommend the project. The suggestions/objections raised by the participants in the public hearing will be noted and it will be included in the minutes of the meeting.

He requested Chairman of the Environment Public Hearing Committee to inform Project Proponent to start the presentation.

Project Officer gave detailed information regarding social welfare schemes carried by the Tata Family

With the permission of the Chairman, the Environmental Consultant of the project made a presentation on the entire Environmental Management Plan (EMP) for the proposed project. He gave information about the geographical location of the proposed project, potential impact on the environment due to the proposed project, environmental management plan prepared for it, Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Fund and Corporate Environmental Responsibility (CER) Fund.

He said that the total cost of the said project will be approximately Rs. 1,119.0 crore and additional 350 persons can get direct employment in the project. Similarly, due to the said project, the indirect business and employment in the area will increase tremendously.

After the presentation, the participants were appealed to raise their suggestions, objections if any. The Environmental Public Hearing Committee appealed to the participants to briefly present their environmental views, suggestions or objections regarding the proposed project. While raising the suggestions, objections, mention your name and village name while registering suggestions or objections.

FOLLOWING PARTICIPANTS HAVE TAKEN PART IN THE DISCUSSIONS AND ANSWERS GIVEN BY PROJECT CONSULTANT/PROJECT PROPONENT/ENVIRONMENT PUBLIC HEARING COMMITTEE:-

1) Shri Manish Sankhe, Residence - Kolwade Gaon, Taluka & District - Palghar:-

I am Chairman of Environment Vigilance Forum Committee and President of Mahatma Gandhi Tantamukti Samiti, Kolwade. The presence of villagers in the meeting is less, because hearing the name of Tata, creates a different motivation. We respect this group. He who is now the Chairman of the Tata group is respected, he is a man of inspiration for the country. This is a public hearing on environmental issues, so some suggestions will be made on behalf of the villagers -

Shri Manish Sankhe said that although the presentation was comprehensive, some environmental factors have to be questioned. Respect is different and loyalty to the village is different.

It is mentioned in the report that you have planted 15,000 trees in the plant. Tarapur is notified as "Industrial Zone." Last year Hon'ble National Green Tribunal (NGT) judged Tarapur as the "largest industrial polluted area" in the country. Accordingly, we experience every day what is the situation.

Originally this project is ZLD project. The concept of ZLD is just for saying to common people and in the name of ZLD, they discharge chemical effluent. Hence, we and the Village Sarpanch should be given detailed information about the ZLD of this project.

It is mentioned in the report that 15,000 trees have been planted.

But there are many difficulties in running an industrial group, basically there is a problem of space. However, there is not enough space in the company premises to plant 15,000 trees. You have developed a green belt in your residential area of Kurgaon. But just planting a lawn does not protect the environment. If local trees (local species) are planted, the environment can be protected.

The Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report prepared as presented is incorrect. The report states that after soil test, water test, ground water quality is asserted to be good. That is completely wrong.

Natural water sources in the area are highly polluted. So soil, water samples from the area must be wrong, they may or may be from Tata Steel premises. But the conclusion of soil, water samples is very wrong.

You have mentioned in the report that our land cultivable. That is completely wrong. The remaining lands we have are barren. Traditional farming is not possible here. However, land quality is barren and waste land are there.

Basically, the factory owners have no space. I have repeatedly suggested that we have waste lands in our village. If village farmers are taken into confidence and if local species especially fruit bearing plants are planted or even group of farmers is made and under the guidance of experts, if agriculture cultivation is carried, definitely there will be environment protection/improved.

Another issue is your Transportation System. Your transportation system is very big. Hundreds of trucks are parked here. There were incidences of accidents and some local people have lost their life. Hence, a Traffic Management Plan (TMP) should be implemented as per Government Rules & Regulations, so that incidences of accidents can be reduced. Parking can be made on odd and even dates on the road side. If the company takes the waste lands of the neighboring farmers on rent by taking the farmers into confidence, then the problem of their livelihood and the problem of security will be solved.

Due to expansion, the project will increase four times. Good luck to the expansion project. However, the proposed project will create 350 new jobs, i.e. a total of 800 people will be directly employed in the project, while the expansion will provide indirect employment to 2,000 people in the area. Similarly, there will be an increase in indirect business in the area.

Here your factories are 100% in Kolwade revenue area. There is 100% contribution of Kolwade village people to your factory. Our forefathers made land available for industries at a nominal cost. But it is sad to say that there were jobs in Tata Steel in the previous generation, now there are no jobs for this generation. But we, the local people are not given priority in the local business that are created here. A positive decision is expected in this regard.

TMRCT Hospital was established here. MIDC had given plots on social basis at a rent of Rs. One only. The hospital is closed due to some reasons. It is resumed/started by Tata Steel. But, though your factory is running /located 100%

on the Kolavade village plots , the Kolavade villagers are not given any concession for medication in this hospital.

This TMRCT hospital is run from a professional perspective. So people here avoid going to that hospital. If Kolwade village is named as project affected and if the residents of Kolwade village get any compensation, then there is no problem.

It is sad to say that you have conducted Zero health camps. However, if health camps are to be organized, Kolwade village should be given priority.

Despite the CSR Fund of crores of rupees, the village where the project is working is not considered. The promise of fencing and beautification of the crematorium is not followed.

The plot of Tarapur Vidya Mandir has been leased by MIDC for Rs. One only. If some subsidy is given to Kolwade villagers at educational institution, Krida Sankul, then the gratitude of this village can be expressed.

You have given an alternative to plastic and conduct training for making cloth and paper bags. If the women's self-help groups get employment through this, it will definitely benefit them.

Regarding Bio-diversity, Mori Khadi is the main drain here. It is overflowing with hazardous sewage. There are three small nallas attached to it. They flow into Mori Creek and all they further into creek. Creek meets the sea. The situation there is bad. The mangrove species were there have become extinct.

Many species of mangroves like Musal mangroves have been destroyed. The indigenous trees that were there are on the verge of extinction. If the Tata Group contributes to rehabilitate, then natural conservation will take place.

I have carried a survey there 2-3 years ago with the help of some experts. We consider "wet land" as "waste land". This is wrong. Everyone knows the importance of Bio-Diversity and Wet Land. So if Tata Group develops a "Bio-diversity Park" with CSR funds, surely Kolwade village will contribute a plot for it.

Solid waste disposal will be an internal part of your Group. The dumping ground is located a few meters away from the project site. It is in very poor condition. We have been fighting for the last 15 years. MIDC should give us a plot and we will dispose of the solid waste in a scientific manner, for which we have given a DPR, but still, the issue is pending. So, if Tata group can use their CSR fund to provide a small waste management project for villages under Kolwade Gram Panchayat, it should be given.

In the report, information in relation to industrial safety is given. The series of factory accidents in the area does not stop. This village is living under fear and pressure. The local people have given their own land for industrial sector, the government/country gets revenue, this industrial sector has benefited people all over the country. But this village is always under the shadow of fear. Although the Tata group is doing good work in industrial security, if the Tata group trains local

young boys and girls and if a "Rescue Squad" is created, the burden on the police force will also be reduced. Hence, the need for training should be noted.

Regarding Rain Water Harvesting, it is stated that rain water is collected and perforated in the soil. This is a welcome step. But if others are given services and guidance in this regard, surely the rain water harvesting project can be implemented in the area.

The information regarding EMP (Environment Management Plan) and CER (Corporate Environment Responsibility) is given. It is promised that nearly 1.80 Crores rupees will be spent. Hence, while preparing DP - Development Plan, if experts are appointed, it will be benefitted. If the fund is spent for Bio-Diversity, then it will be definitely helping environment protection. If the help of local people is sought while spending EMP and CER, it will be also beneficial as local people know about local natural resources e.g. lake, natural water courses, local species, land sloping etc. Alongwith Tata Group, we will also contribute.

Tata is the inspiration of the country. Tata group is setting up such a big project in our village, if local people are taken into confidence for the required manpower, then our contribution to the Tata group will be permanent. We are not opposing to the project. There is no opposition to development. But we will always there for sustainable development.

Convener, Environmental Public Hearing Committee asked Project officials to give detailed information regarding ZLD project, similarly, where and how the tree plantation will be carried and if there is any plan of the Project Proponent to come together and develop the green belt on the waste land of the village as suggested by Shri Manish Sankhe. Participants should be given detailed information.

Project Proponent while replying informed that ours is a ZLD project, it is truly a ZLD project. He appealed Shri Manish Sankhe to come and see the project in person. Not even a single drop of treated water is generated outside the project. Online Monitoring System is operational in the project and it is connected to the servers of Central Pollution Control Board, New Delhi and Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Mumbai. Everything is recorded online.

He informed that RO (Reverse Osmosis) system is in operation. The treated effluent from the ETP goes to R.O. system. It is treated at RO system. We are proud that we have the highest recovery project in MIDC Tarapur. We recover 87% water. Rest waste is evaporated. The waste from the water is sent to Mumbai Waste Management.

So, rest assured that this project is a ZLD project and you should not have any doubts. We have given information (Display) about this on the notice board. If you need more information about it, it will be made available.

Project Proponent further stated that Shri Manish Sankhe raised a wide range of issues. Answers are being given to those issues with which comes into daily contact –

Shri Manish Sankhe had raised the issue regarding traffic. So, considering the current situation and need of the future, we have rented a place. The transportation part is being developed there. Transport of vehicles will be done in a well-planned manner. If you look at the last 15-20 days, you would have noticed that not many trucks are seen at the company gate/road. We will expand it further. Here further action is taken on the transport system.

Project Proponent further said that Shri Manish Sankhe demanded to develop a green belt on the waste land of the village. He replied that trees were planted in the Miyawaki method. Preference is given to local trees. We have taken note of it and a small patch has been developed in this factory. The remaining 11,000 trees will be planted. Waste land will definitely be considered for plantation.

At this moment, Shri Manish Sankhe, while registering objection regarding Miyawaki, said that where the plot is less, trees of various breeds and species are planted. But their life span is very short. He further said that if the Project Management is going to spend so much money, as you don't have land, we will make it available. He said that he would appeal to the villagers that those who have fallow land should plant trees on the embankment. Miyawaki doesn't do much for the environment. It is better than nothing. However, it would be more environmentally friendly to plant local species.

Project Proponent assured here that if the waste land is made available, definite plantation of trees will be done on it and it can be started in the ensuing monsoon season.

Shri Manish Sankhe demanded that as crematorium is planned, hence compound wiring and beautification should be undertaken on priority. Project Proponent gave an assurance in this regard.

Convener, Environmental Public Hearing Committee, appealed to the participants to raise any suggestions or objections regarding the proposed project.

2) Shri Narendra Sankhe, Residence-Bori Gaon, Tal & District - Palghar :-

This MIDC is started in 1970-80s. We observed loved for this MIDC. Many accidents happened in this MIDC. But in the last 40 years, I have not read any accident in the said company. Project's Environmental Consultant provided information in Environmental Impact Assessment Report regarding survey and

analysis. The officials of the project gave information about the expansion of the project. I am confident that Tata Steel will look into the issues raised by Mr. Manish Sankhe.

Tata Steel has planted many trees around the company premises. Environment becomes polluted when water, air, soil is polluted and noise is beyond the level. But I have not read anything in the paper that Tata Steel has polluted these four elements of the environment. Also, this project will create employment in the area.

Hence, as a citizen, I express my wish that the said project should be started immediately, I support the project. We request Government to approve the project immediately.

Convener, Environmental Public Hearing Committee, appealed to the participants to raise any suggestions or objections regarding the proposed project.

3) Shri Santosh Raut, Prime Minister Awardee, Residence - Kelve, Taluka & District - Palghar :-

This company is in operation in Tarapur MIDC for the last 29 years. The company organizes many programs giving importance to safety and environment. Periodic mock drills are conducted in this company considering the accident rate at Boisar MIDC. At this time representatives of other companies, workers, officers and employees of the fire department of MIDC are called and shown demonstrations.

This will definitely help in reducing the accident rate. Work in this company is not done without following SOPs and wearing full safety gear. The company works only by using positive assurance while working. This plant is considered as a "Zero Accident Project" in Tata Steel. Similarly, the balance of the environment is also maintained. Contaminated water, sewage is not released into the ground.

Many times tree plantation programmes are conducted in the company. This project is considered as Zero Liquid Discharge (ZLD). The business of this company is conducted ethically and in compliance with government regulations. Female employees are treated well. Similarly, Jyoti Scholarship is given from Jamshedpur to the tribal girls of nearby schools. Therefore, their educational progress has also improved.

I live in Kevale village, which is about 25-50 km away. Our school is there. The tribal children who are in this school also get benefit from this facility. While our country has to import Hot Rolled Pickled Galvanized Coils from abroad, the said project will produce Hot Rolled Pickled Galvanized Coils. So we are very happy about this project. More projects of Tata Steel should come here, so local people will get jobs. So Maharashtra will develop. However, this project should be started as early as possible.

Convener, Environmental Public Hearing Committee, opined that it would be better if the people of the affected Gram Panchayats were also trained in the mock drill accident in this project. We hope that the Company Administration will take note of this.

4) Shri Saimond Rodricks, Residence - Vasai Virar, Tal & District - Palghar:-

I am a resident of Vasai Virar and working in Tata Steel Company for last 30 years. A special issue to be mentioned is that due to Corona there was a lockdown from 20th March, 2019. The company took great care of us at that time, because the atmosphere of fear was created during the Corona period. The company paid

five months' salary to the people of Vasai Virar and the local people managed the project. I thank the local people and Tata Steel management for their co-operation.

5) Shri Deepak Laxman Patil, Residence-Kolvade Gaon Police Patil, Tal & District - Palghar :-

My village is next to Tata Steel. We use road which is opposite to the company. The security they maintain is admirable. Although, Shri Manish Sankhe has raised the problems of Kolvade village, Tata Steel should solve the problems of Kolvade village on priority. I hope Tata Steel Management will take proper notice in this regard.

Currently, the burning issue here is that the crematorium has no compound wall and no beautification. It is necessary to do it. Immigrants goes there and breaks and destroys the various materials. If the village welfare is considered, then, the village will also co-operate with this company. Our Kolvade village is polluted. We cannot stay here even for four days. We are worried about health.

I hope the company management will resolve the issues raised in the public hearing.

Project officer said that around 24 workers are from Kolvade village. The project has state-of-the-art machinery, robotics, all computerized systems. Therefore, the minimum educational qualification of the required workers should be ITI, NCVT. If there is educational qualification it is considered.

6) Shri Jayant Atkar, Former Corporator, Vasai Virar, Taluka & District - Palghar :-

Thanks to the Government for organizing this public hearing. All participants here have said good things about Tata Steel. We hope to start this project soon after deciding the direct employment and indirect employment generated by this project.

He questioned the Project Officer as to whether the CSR fund is limited to the taluka only or district wise. A detailed answer should be given in this regard.

Shri Deepak Laxman Patil, Kolvade Village Police Patil objected that if ITI is to be taken in the project, then engineers should be taken. At that time, the project officer said that the minimum educational qualification is ITI and some colleges have been notified by the company for the recruitment of engineers. Some colleges are notified by the company all over India/ country level.

Here **Shri Manish Sankhe** opined that whenever job opportunities are created, the local people, concerned Gram Panchayats should be informed about it. Mobile phones of concerned officers should be made available. Discipline will remain mandatory even if it is local person.

At that time, Project Proponent informed that 83% of the total posts have been allotted to local people in the project. When the project was established, employment was created only in compliance with the Maharashtra Government

regulations and even now employment will be created and the local people will be given employment only in accordance with the Maharashtra Government regulations.


Project Officials informed that the people of the surrounding villages like Kurgaon, Nandgaon, Murba, Khairapada, Boisar are working in the project.


While concluding the meeting, Chairman, Environment Public Hearing Committee said that it was a happy day. The participants in the meeting expressed their respect and affection towards the Tata Group while giving their suggestions. With so many years of tradition, no one else has been able to maintain the principles. In the meeting here, the local people have insisted that the proposed project should be started at the earliest.


Chairman opined that the Environmental Consultant had given detailed information about the proposed project and the Environmental Management Plan. He congratulated the participants for presenting their points properly. Chairman thanked everyone and declared the public hearing is concluded.

Meeting ended extending thanks to the Chair.

Enclosed herewith 1 no of written suggestions, objections received on 11.01.2023.


(Prashant Gaikwad)
Convener,
Environment Public Hearing Committee
And
Sub Regional Officer,
Tarapur-1,
Maharashtra Pollution
Control Board,
Tarapur


(Ravindra Andhale)
Member,
Environment Public Hearing
Committee
And
Regional Officer,
Maharashtra Pollution
Control Board,
Thane


(Balasaheb Kolekar)
Chairman,
Environment Public Hearing Committee
And
Additional District Magistrate, Palghar,
Dist - Palghar

