

MAHARASHTRA POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

SUB-REGIONAL OFFICE, CHANDRAPUR

Phone: 07172-251965/272410

Fax: 07172-251965

Visit us at www.mpcb.gov.in

E-mail: srochandrapur@mpcb.gov.in



"Your Service is our Duty"

Sub-Regional Office
Udyog Bhavan, 1st Floor
Railway Station Road,
Chandrapur-442401

No. MPCB / SROC / 1265 / 2022

Date: 08 / 03 / 2022

To,
The Joint Director (WPC),
M. P. C. Board, Sion (E),
Mumbai-22.

d/c

Sub:- Minutes Of The Public Hearing For Proposed Sand Ghats (Total 51) Of Chandrapur District.

Ref:- 1) Board's Office Order No. E-05 of 2021 dated 21/01/2022 regarding Panel.
2) Public Hearing conducted on 25/01/2022 at Niyojan Bahvan, Collector Office, Chandrapur.

Sir,

With reference to above cited subject matter, District Mining Officer, Chandrapur had applied to the Board for conducting Environmental Public Hearing for their Proposed Project of Sand Ghats (Total 51) of Chandrapur District.

The Public Hearing was conducted on 25/01/2022 at 12:30 PM at Collector Office, Chandrapur, Tal. Dist. Chandrapur. Submitting herewith the copies of proceedings of the Public Hearing as under;

- 1) Minutes of Public Hearing in English & Marathi (One original Copy & one photocopy).
- 2) Copies of written submissions received regarding project.
- 3) Copy of attendance sheet.
- 4) DVD of video shooting at the time of Public Hearing.
- 5) Office order for constitution of Public Hearing Panel.
- 6) Notices of Public Hearing published in English & Marathi Newspapers.
- 7) Executive Summary (English & Marathi).
- 8) EMP Report.

This is submitted for your perusal and onward submission.

Thanking you.

Yours Faithfully

U. B. Bhadule

(U. B. Bhadule)

I/c. Sub-Regional Officer, Chandrapur.

Copy submitted for information to:-

- 1) The District Collector, District Collector Office, Chandrapur.
- 2) Regional Officer, M. P. C. Board, Chandrapur.
- 3) EIC, M. P. C. Board, Mumbai – for display on website of the Board.

Copy for information to:-

District Mining Officer, Collector Office, Chandrapur.

21/03/2022
आवक लिपिक
जिल्हाधिकारी, चंद्रपूर

16/03/2022
आवक - जावक
खनिज शाखा
जिल्हाधिकारी कार्यालय, चंद्रपूर

MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC HEARING FOR PROPOSED SAND GHATS (TOTAL 51) OF CHANDRAPUR DISTRICT CONDUCTED COMBINELY BY MAHRASHTRA POLLUTION CONTORL BOARD & DISTRICT MINING OFFICE, MINING DEPARTMENT CHANDRAPUR.

Preamble :-

District Mining Officer, Mining Department, Collector Office, Chandrapur, Tal. Dist. Chandrapur has applied for Environmental Clearance to the Ministry of Environment & Climate Change, Govt. of Maharashtra, Mantralaya, Mumbai for Proposed Project of 51 Sand Ghats for the year 2021-22 located Taluka level of Dist. Chandrapur.

Accordingly, project proponent had submitted an application to Maharashtra Pollution Control Board (MPCB) for conducting Public Hearing as per the provisions of EIA Notification -2006 and TOR issued by Govt. of India. In this connection, MPC Board decided to hold public hearing in respect of the said project on 25/01/2022 in consultation with District Collector, Chandrapur. Maharashtra Pollution Control Board has published public notices in Marathi newspaper namely "Lokmat" and English newspaper "The Times of India" on dated 24/12/2021. The appeal was made to the concerned to submit objections, suggestions, complaints, comments, if any, in respect of the said project to concerned regulatory authorities.

Copy of draft E.I.A. report along with executive summary in respect of the said project were made available in English/ Marathi in the following offices to apprise the public.

- (1) Environment Department, 15th Floor, New Administrative Building, Govt. of Maharashtra, Mantralaya, Mumbai – 400032.
- (2) Joint Director (Water Pollution Control), Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Kalpataru Point, 3rd and 4th Floor, Opp. Cine Planet, Near Sion Circle, Sion (E), Mumbai-400022.
- (3) Regional Office & Sub-Regional Office, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, First Floor, Udyog Bhavan, Opposite Bus-Stand, Railway Station Road, Chandrapur.
- (4) Collector Office Chandrapur,
- (5) Zilla Parishad Chandrapur,
- (6) District Industries Center, Chandrapur.
- (7) All 51 concerned Gram Panchayat Offices of Dist. Chandrapur:- Palasgaon, Vitthalwada, Yenbothla, Hiwara, Kultha, Aarvi, Bamarda, Wakal, Kalambgaon Tukum, Kalambgaon Ganna, Mohadi, Virvha, Ladbori, Saradpar (Sindewahi), Sarandi, Ralegaon (Rith), Mangali (Rey), Chaknaleshwar, Chak Dahegaon-2, Borchandli, Maregaon, Saradpar (Chimur), Usegaon, Halda-2, Awalgaon, Chichgaon, Ranmochan,

Bodhegaon, Kharkada, Sondri, Nakoda, Samda Buz., Mul-Akapur, Chichala, Chak Dahegaon (Mul), Naleshwar, Chitegaon, Sushi Dabgaon, Yergaon, Bhejgaon, Rajoli, Ushralachak, Kag, Gondeda, Karanji, Tulana-1, Tulana-2, Kolshi Khu., Timsi Rith, Ajaypur Gondsawari, Khambala, Mangaon, Dist. Chandrapur.

- (8) All Sub-Divisional Offices, Tahsil Offices & Panchayat Samiti Offices, Dist. Chandrapur.

The above authorities at Sr. No. 4 to 6 above, were also requested to arrange wide publicity within their respective jurisdiction requesting the affected persons to send their comments to the concerned regulatory authorities.

The venue for the said public hearing was decided at Niyojan Bhavan, Collector Office premises, Chandrapur, Tal. Dist. Chandrapur. The said venue was finalized considering easy accessibility to local people on the site of proposed project.

A Public Hearing Panel comprising of the following members was constituted by Maharashtra Pollution Control Board vide letter no. BO/JD(WPC)/PH/B-220121-FTS-0189 dated 21/01/2022 (Office Order no. E-05 of 2022 (Annexure-I) in accordance with the EIA Notification dated 14th September, 2006 and as amended thereto issued by Ministry of Environment, Forest, Climate Change, Govt. of India, New Delhi:-

- | | | |
|--|---|-----------------|
| 1. Shri. Vishalkumar Meshram,
Additional District Magistrate,
Collector Office, Chandrapur | - | Chairman |
| 2. Shri. A. M. Kare
Regional Officer,
MPCB, Chandrapur | - | Member |
| 3. Shri. U. B. Bhadule
I/c. Sub-Regional Officer,
MPCB, Chandrapur | - | Convener |

I/c. Sub-Regional Officer, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Chandrapur and Convener, Public Hearing Committee welcomed the dignitaries on the stage and the citizens present in the hall for the Public Hearing. He also requested the permission of the chairman of the committee to start public hearing on the environmental issues.

The written submissions were received and attendance sheet of Public Hearing Panel as well as the concerns participated for the said public hearing is attached as Annexure-"II" and "III" respectively.

MINUTES OF PUBLIC HEARING :-

At the outset, on behalf of convener of the public hearing panel, Shri. Umashankar B. Bhadule, I/c. Sub-Regional Officer Chandrapur, MPCB welcomed all those present and commenced the public hearing. He apprised the people with the introductory information about the purpose of the public hearing and appealed them to come forward with suggestions, complaints, objections & comments, if any, about the environmental aspects of the proposed project. He thereafter requested Hon'ble Chairman to commence the hearing procedure.

Hon'ble Chairman briefed people about the concept and objective of Public Hearing. He made an appeal to participants & all to attend the public hearing peacefully and place their views regarding Environment aspect. He stated that videography of the said public hearing is being carried out by MPCB as per the procedure laid down in EIA Notification 2006. Chairman further stated that the presentation about the proposed projects will be given by the project proponent and then the questions/ objections shall be raised by participants. He made an appeal to participants to come forward with their name & address before raising any query/objections so that the name of the participant along with views will be included in the proceedings of meeting. Then Chairman requested project proponent to give the presentation of the projects along with its salient features.

After that Shri. Kishan Pandit Sharma, Environment Consultant made a Power Point Presentation on the Environment aspects of the projects including salient features of EIA Report in Marathi as well as in English language. The project proponent elaborated the details of proposed project on following grounds;

- Project Description.
- Base Line Data with respect to Air, Water, Land, Noise, Ecology, Settlements, etc.
- Impact likely to occur due to the project on Air, Water, Noise, Hydrology, Settlements and Bio-diversity and forest.
- Mitigation measures and Environment management plan for the project during construction phase as well as operation.
- Other details as outlined in the EIA Report.

Thereafter, convener of Public Hearing announced that the forum is open for question answer. The summary of issues raised, and reply submitted by project proponent is as below.

FOLLOWING HAVE PARTICIPATED DURING THE DISCUSSIONS, QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS / MADE BY PROJECT PROPONENT/ MPCB GIVEN BY PROJECT PROPONENT/PROJECT CONSULTANT/PUBLIC HEARING COMMITTEE

1) Shri. Naitam District Mining Officer, Mining Dept., Chandrapur:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1		<p>The objections & suggestions will be heard & will be reported to the Govt. Problems will be sorted out at District Level also. Information such as names & areas of Sand Ghats are given. Advertisements in English & Marathi were published in newspapers. Sand will be excavated except for 3 meters. Sand will be excavated as per suggestions given during survey. If sand is available in abundance, only then sand will be excavated. The objective of sand mining is to provide sand for national construction projects, state construction projects & other construction projects and generate revenue through sand mining. Sand mining will be carried out on govt. land as per provisions made in land notification of year 2009. Information regarding Sand ghats of Gondpipri Taluka such as names, areas & number of sand ghats is given. An offset amount of Rs. 42668840/- will be generated by excavating</p>

		<p>240835 brass of sand. As per sand policy of state govt. distance, length & breadth of sand ghats is decided. There is no need of explosives during sand mining. The depth of 0.5 to 1 meters is decided for excavation as per suggestions given by Ground Water Survey & Development Authority. Only tractors will be allowed for transportation of sand from sand ghats. The responsibility of Display boards, security, will lie upon owners. Also the responsibility of installation of water sprinkling & repairing & maintenance of roads will lie upon owners of sand ghats. Overloading of sand will not be allowed. Vehicles having PUC certificate & less than 15 years old only will be allowed. Sand excavation will only be allowed in daytime as per state govt. decision dtd. 03/09/2019.</p>
--	--	--

FOLLOWING HAVE PARTICIPATED ONLINE DURING THE DISCUSSIONS, QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS / MADE BY PROJECT PROPONENT/ MPCB GIVEN BY PROJECT PROPONENT/PROJECT CONSULTANT/PUBLIC HEARING COMMITTEE

2) Shri. Haribhau Yengantiwar, Sarpanch, Borchandli:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	Copy of Govt. Resolution/rules regarding sand excavation shall be made available to Grampanchayats.	Shri. Naitam, District Mining Officer, Chandrapur told that, state govt. has published a GR on 03/09/2019 regarding sand excavation. The same is available on State Govt. website. If there are any difficulties in finding the GR then the copy is available with this office.

3) Shri. Sanjay Tirpat, Chandrapur:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	The said Public Hearing Sand Ghats is conducted as per which policy?	<p>Shri. Naitam told that, the Public Hearing is conducted as per EIA Notification published by MOEF&CC, New Delhi dtd. 14/09/2006 & amendment dtd. 01/12/2009.</p> <p>Convenor of the Public Hearing said that, the Public Hearing is conducted as per EIA Notification published by MOEF&CC, New Delhi dtd. 14/09/2006 & amendment dtd. 01/12/2009. Advertisements were published 30 days prior i.e. on 24/12/2021 in Daily Marathi Newspaper Lokmat & Daily English newspaper The Time of India. The copies of EIA/EMP & Executive Summary in English & Marathi were kept in offices</p>

		mention in advertisement for study of people.
2	1 meter of sand is excavated or 3 meters. Which one is correct? Sand is excavated below 3 meters.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, mining permission & environmental permission is given by Technical Committee. If any non-compliances are found then Tahsildar will take action & an amount is forfeited by the State Govt.
3	There is no sand above 1 meter is available in 42-meter bank of Andhari River. There is no inclusion of Groundwater table, GSDA Data, HFL etc. If there was any sand available at 2 or 3 meters then it would have caused floods during monsoon & all the animals would have come out of the surrounding jungle.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, there is no fact. The report is finalized as per survey report given by Technical Sub-committee.

4) Shri. Sandip Meshram, Chandrapur:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	Policy published in 2019 has been cancelled regarding sand mining. Therefore, the said Public Hearing is illegally conducted? New policies are not being implemented.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, no new notification or circular is received to this office regarding cancellation of policy dtd. 03/09/2019. Until & unless notification is received, old notification will be implemented. Hon'ble National Green Tribunal (NGT) in accordance with the Order No. 368/2015 dated 19/09/2018 in coordination with the Ministry of

		Environment, Forests and Climate Change, New Delhi, to make favorable changes in the policy as per Sustainable Sand Mining Guidelines, 2016 and Sand Mining Framework, 2018 and 2020 gave instructions for holding a public hearing. Public Hearing is compulsory in both the notifications.
2	Documents shall be shown if this public hearing is conducted as per notification dtd. 14/09/2006.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, the Public Hearing is conducted as per EIA Notification published by MOEF&CC, New Delhi dtd. 14/09/2006 & amendment dtd. 01/12/2009.
3	There is no information available in EIA Notification & its amendments. You are conducting this public hearing as instructions of State Govt. EIA Notification & its amendments shall be shown right now.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam told the person to submit their objections in writing & copy of EIA Notification & its amendments will be available at office. The Public Hearing is conducted as per EIA Notification published by MOEF&CC, New Delhi dtd. 14/09/2006 & amendment dtd. 01/12/2009.
4	DSR should have been published from 07/01/2020 to 08/04/2020, it shall include new sand ghats. Also, it shall be published on websites.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, Draft DSR was published on District website on 29/11/2021 for one month & suggestions & objections were called. But no objections & suggestions were received & DSR was finalized on 30/11/2021.
5	There is no information mentioned in DSR report of Andhari River. Also,	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, no any

	Ajaypur Sandghat falls under core zone.	sand ghat falls under core or buffer zone. Also, information is mentioned in DSR report of Andhari River.
6	There is no mention of Reclamation in present DSR report. No method is given in SSM. Also no mention in PowerPoint Presentation. Which method is implemented?	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, all the things are included in Mining Plan & DSR Report. Information regarding Sand replenishment is given in DSR & as per Generic structure of Replenishment Study mentioned in Enforcement & Monitoring Guidelines for Sand Mining, 2020, study about replenishment is done. It was not included in Power Point Presentation.
7	There is no information mentioned in DSR report of Andhari River as this river is important for animals of Chandrapur District. Also, Ajaypur Sandghat falls under core zone.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, no any sand ghat falls under core or buffer zone. Also information is mentioned in DSR report of Andhari River.
8	Baseline Data is not available in EMP. DSR is not uploaded on website. I request the chairman to incorporate these objections in Minutes of Public Hearing.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, the point is noted.

FOLLOWING HAVE PARTICIPATED OFFLINE DURING THE DISCUSSIONS, QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS / MADE BY PROJECT PROPONENT/ MPCB GIVEN BY PROJECT PROPONENT/PROJECT CONSULTANT/PUBLIC HEARING COMMITTEE

5) Shri. V. Sunanda Reddy, Environmentalist, Hyderabad:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	I am an Environmentalist & I support the project. I have experience of about 35 years in Environment. As per my experience it is important to excavate sand as 20% of sand is eroded in monsoons. Soil cannot be kept stored in Rivers. If sand is excavated properly then it can be utilized for Central, State govt. & other construction projects which will give rise to employment. Water levels can be increased after sand mining. Tree plantation can be carried out in nearby villages of sand ghats from the generated revenue. I congratulate the Project Proponent & give unconditional support.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, the points are noted.

6) Shri. Krushnamurthy, Hyderabad:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	I support the project & I request to accord approval from Environment Ministry.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, the points are noted.

7) Farmer, Rajura:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	My agricultural field is located on the bank of river but there is protection wall around sand ghat.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, boundary pillars are kept for demarking the boundary of sand ghat. No protection wall is erected.

8) Sarpanch, Grampanchayat Usegaon, Dist. Chandrapur:-

Sr. No.	Objection/Suggestion/ Question	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	Our Gram Panchayat has refused the auction in Gram Sabha.	District Mining Officer Shri. Naitam informed that, the points are noted.

9) Shri. Umashankar B. Bhadule, Convenor of Public Hearing & I/c. Sub-Regional Officer, M. P. C. Board, Chandrapur:-

Sr. No.	Comments / made by Project Proponent/ MPCB
1	Shri. Umashankar B. Bhadule, Convenor of Public Hearing & I/c. Sub-Regional Officer, M. P. C. Board, Chandrapur stated that, auction of sand ghats shall be carried out as per directions given by Hon'ble National Green Tribunal, New Delhi.

The Chairman of Public Hearing Panel & District Collector, Chandrapur called on the public present to come up with their questions/ objections/ suggestions if any. Nobody then raised any question /objection /suggestions.

The Chairman of the Committee while concluding the proceedings, summarized various points raised and declared that public hearing is ended, and concluded the public hearing with vote of thanks.

(U. B. Bhadule)
Convenor of the Public
Hearing Committee and
I/c. Sub Regional Officer,
MPCB, Chandrapur

(A. M. Kare)
Member of the Public
Hearing Committee and
Regional Officer, MPCB,
Chandrapur

(Vishalkumar Meshram)
Chairman of the Public
Hearing Committee &
Additional District
Collector, Collector Office.
Chandrapur