

MINUTES OF ENVIRONMENTAL PUBLIC HEARING IN RESPECT OF M/S. PAONARKHARI MINERALS & CHEMICALS PVT LTD. AT PAONARKHARI, POST GOBARWAHI, TQ. TUMSAR, DIST: BHANDARA CONDUCTED ON 25/07/2014 AT 12.00 NOON AT GODAVARIBAI PODAR SMRUTI BHAVAN, PAONARKHARI, POST GOBARWAHI, TQ. TUMSAR, DIST: BHANDARA.

An environmental public hearing in respect of M/s. Paonarkhari Minerals & Chemicals for their proposed **expansion project of Mineral Beneficiation Plant (Manganese Ore) – 12000 MT/Annum** at Village Paonarkhari, Post Gobarwahi, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara was conducted on 25/07/2014 at 12.00 noon at Godavaribai Podar Smruti Bhavan, Paonarkhari, Post Gobarwahi, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara.

Following members were present during the public hearing :

1. Shri Milind Bansod,
Additional Collector,
Bhandara, Dist: Bhandara. Chairman.
2. Shri N.H. Shivangi,
Regional Officer, MPCB, Nagpur. Member.
3. Shri L.S. Bhad,
Sub-Regional Officer,
MPCB, Bhandara. Convener.

A list of members and public participants present for Public Hearing is annexed herewith. All those present were given welcome by the Convener. **Shri L.S. Bhad**, Sub-Regional Officer, MPCB, Bhandara with the permission of the Chairman of Panel stated that due to establishment of proposed project of M/s. Paonarkhari Minerals & Chemicals, what impact will be there on the people in the village as well as surrounding environment and therefore to discuss various environmental issues, like suggestions, objections, doubts, etc., this environmental public hearing is being conducted here today on 25/07/2014. Thereafter, with the permission of the Chairman of Panel, he requested the Project Proponent to brief the power point presentation of their proposed project.

Then, **Shri Manish Goyanka**, the Project Proponent stated that initially the existing project of M/s. Paonarkhari was established in the year 1995, which is registered with the District Industries Centre as a Small Scale Industry. He stated that M/s. Paonarkhari Minerals & Chemicals, Village Pawnarkhari, Post Gobarwahi, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara has submitted application to Ministry of Environment & Forests, Govt. of India, New Delhi for Environment Impact Assessment and Environment Management Study through a renowned consulting agency, M/s. Asian Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd., 66, Hemkunt Colony, Nehru Palace, New Delhi, which is ISO certified by Quality Council of India for Mineral Improvement & Peletization under Certificate No. NABET/EIA/1013/012.ACE ISO 9001 : 2008.

Shri Rahul Wankhede from MPCB, Bhandara stated that the MPCB had given a public notice in the newspapers Daily Lokmat and Daily Hitwad dated 24/06/2014 in English & Marathi language as per the Notification issued by MoEF dated 14th September, 2006 (as amended) so that the people in the surrounding area can record their views, objections, complaint, suggestions, etc. about the said project. However, the MPCB has not received any written objection, complaint, suggestion, etc. He requested the public participants that now they can express their views, objections, suggestions, etc. about the said project without pressure of anybody. Before that the public participants shall have to understand that what the exact project is, its impact on surrounding environment, control measures and plans proposed by the Project Proponent, etc. and same will be briefed by the Project Proponent. He stated that the documents pertaining to the said project viz. Environment Impact Assessment, etc. are placed at the Collector Office. Here is a Government Committee in which the Additional District Collector is the Chairman and MPCB Official is the Member. The committee will record total proceedings of the public hearing and same will be sent to the Central Government. It may be noted that to grant the permission is not in the purview of this committee or MPCB and same is under the purview of Government. He stated that the role of the MPCB and committee is only to submit a detailed report about the said project including the objections, suggestions, representation, etc. to be raised by the public participants to the Government and the decision for grant of permission for the said project will be taken by the Government. Then, he requested the Project Proponent to brief the detail information about their proposed project.

Shri Manish Goyanka, the Project Proponent started the power point presentation of their proposed project and stated that M/s. Paonarkhari Minerals & Chemicals Pvt. Ltd., village Paonarkhari, Post Gobarwahi, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara is registered with the District Industries Centre as a small scale industry and the licensed capacity of which was **5000** TPA and now, it has been proposed to establish the expansion project of the same having **12000** TPA capacity at village Paonarkhari, Post Gobarwahi, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara. A renowned company, M/s. Asian Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd. is their consulting company, which has been awarded with ISO certification by Quality Council of India for Mineral Improvement & Pelentization. The Ministry of Environment & Forests, Govt. of India has granted the Terms of Reference (TOR). The Environment Impact Assessment (EIA) of the proposed project has been prepared by M/s. Asian Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd. He shown the layout plant of the proposed project and stated that the location of said project is in Bhandara district, Maharashtra State of India.

He stated that the longitude of the proposed project is 29d,32m,03.64c North and latitude is 79d, 42m, 32.97c East. There is no any National Park, Sanctuary, Reserved Elephant/Tiger Project, etc. located in the area of **10** km. radius of the proposed project site. The existing plant area is **4000** sq.m. and **2500** sq.m. is reserved for the proposed expansion project. The existing capacity of M/s. Paonarkhari Minerals & Chemicals Pvt. Ltd. is **1000** Tonnes/Annum and the proposed capacity is of **6000** Tonnes/Annum. The existing capacity of Manganese Dioxide & other Processed Minerals is **300** Tonnes/Annum and proposed capacity of the same is **6000** Tonnes/Annum. The requirement of Manganese Ore for the proposed expansion project is **15000** Tonnes and the proposed source of the same is Dongari Bujurg Mine. The existing coal requirement is **40** Tonnes and after expansion, its requirement will be **240** Tonnes and the

existing coke requirement is **255 Tonnes** and after expansion, **1535 Tonnes** of coke will be required and the same will be supplied by the iron (*polad*) manufacturing industries. He further shown the process diagram of Manganese Ore. He further stated that at present the requirement of electricity is **54 KW** and after expansion, it will be **200 KW** and the source of electricity is the Maharashtra State Electricity Distribution Company Ltd., Tumsar. A D.G. Set of **40 KVA** capacity is available for the supply of electricity during the power failure. He shown the chart of water balance, wherein the requirement of water for construction and process purposes is mentioned. .

Shri Wankhede asked whether the processing will be done as per the chart shown during the presentation, upon which **Shri Goyanka** stated that the proposed water consumption for various purposes is as Goods Washing – **4 M³/day**, Material Cooling – **12 M³/day**, Domestic Uses – **3 M³/day** and Sprinkling on Road – **4 M³/day** and the effluent generation from the proposed project will be **6.4 M³/day**, which will be recycled in the process. The water required for the septic tank is **0.8 M³/day** and for the plantation and gardening, the water requirement is **7.0 M³/day**.

After asking by **Shri Wankhede** about the manufacturing process of proposed expansion project, **Shri Goyanka** briefed the same as under :

Manganese Dioxide - The Manganese Ore will be taken into closed circuit sizer where it will run in **4** frictions. After that it will be washed in washing cradle, then it will be subjected to **3** roller grinding mill where it will be formed into powder, which will be packed into **50 kg** HDPE recycled bags and then will be sold. The sludge generated after washing will be sent to settling tank and then it will be recycled in the process or will be sold.

Manganese Oxide - In this process, the powder containing Manganese Ore will be pressed through briquette press and after that it will be dried and roasted and then MnO will be produced, which further subjected to **3** roller grinding mill and after formation of powder, the same will be packed in **50 kg** HDPE recycled bags and then it will be sold. He stated that the approximate material for construction required will be as Cement – **50 Ton**, Sand – **150 Ton** and Gitti – **200 Ton**.

Shri Goyanka further briefed about the land environment, usage, etc. and stated that the forest area is **153.66 sq.m.** and its percentage is **48.7 sq.m.**, the total area of agriculture land is **114.89 sq.m** and its percentage is **36.81 sq.m.** The area of river and lake is **5.03 sq.m.** & **8.09 sq.m.** and its percentage is **1.06 sq.m.** & **2.58 sq.m.** respectively. The area of dry river bed is **1.77 sq.m.** and its percentage is **0.56 sq.m.**, which is in ready condition spread in **30.62 sq.m.** and its percentage is **9.75 sq.m.** The climate in Bhandara district is hot and dry and the maximum and minimum temperature of the area is **45 °C** & **60 °C** respectively. Average annual rainfall in the district is **1250 to 1500 mm** and the annual rainfall during this rainy season is **95%** of South-West Monsoon. He further briefed about the wind after monsoon period and stated that (September to November) the wind speed is **1.67 m/sec.** and out of total period, **7.55%** times the wind is calm.

Baseline Environmental Condition :

Air Quality Monitoring : To know the air quality in the study area, they had selected 6 locations in the area of 10 km. radius of the proposed project and the air quality observed in the area was as follows :

PM ₁₀	-	37.45 to 45.10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
PM _{2.5}	-	13.67 to 18.09 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
SO ₂	-	6.76 to 9.04 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
NOx	-	10.38 to 13.93 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$

From the above, it is seen that all the parameters were within the prescribed limit. However, as per NAAQ Standards, 2009, the concentration of free Silicon in PM₁₀ was 2.65%.

They have carried out the soil testing at 4 locations in the 10 km. radius of baseline study area of environmental condition and observed the parameters as pH – 6.52 to 7.70 (neutral range), Organic Matter – 1.05 to 1.51, P. Density – 1.38 to 1.55 gm/cc, Available Nitrogen – 222.10 to 332.32 kg/ha and Available Potassium – 102.23 to 167.16 kg/ha and the soil in the area was sticky.

Noise Level Monitoring : The noise level monitoring was carried out at 9 locations in the study area during the day and night time and observed that the noise level was 32.7 to 53.8 dB(A) during day time from 06.00 a.m. to 10.00 p.m. and 25.2 to 40.3 dB(A) during night time from 10.00 p.m. to 06.00 a.m., which was within the prescribed limit.

Water Quality Monitoring : The ground water quality monitoring and surface water quality monitoring was carried out at 5 and 4 locations respectively in the study area. The ground water quality observed as TDS in the range of 245.0 to 409.0 mg/l, pH in the range of 7.2 to 7.9, Total Alkalinity (CaCO₃) in the range of 110.0 to 176.0 mg/l and Hardness in the range of 110.0 to 187.4 mg/l., which is within the limits as per the Drinking Water Standards IS 10500 : 2009. The surface water quality observed in the area as TDS in the range of 109.3 to 135.9 mg/l, pH in the range of 7.1 to 7.8, Total Alkalinity (CaCO₃) in the range of 48.7 to 89.9 mg/l and Hardness in the range of 45.1 to 75.2 mg/l., which is also within the prescribed limits.

Biological Environment : There are various types of plant species in the study area. The area falls under the hot aired zone. There are mixed forests as well as teak forests in Bhandara and Bhalaghat districts. The other plants in the study area are *Bel*, *Tendu*, *Yeruni*, *Pimpal*, *Palas* & *Halad*, etc. **Shri Goyanka** further showed the list of animals occurred in the study area, which includes the mammals like monkey, Deer, Hare, Indian mouse, etc.; birds like Parrot, Pigeon, etc. and reptiles like Garden Lizard, etc.

Socio-economic Condition : A study has been conducted at various villages in Tumsar Tehsil of Bhandara district in Maharashtra like Chincholi, Ganeshpur, Gobarwahi, Kodbi, Pawnarkhari, Bahmni, Yedarbuchi, Pandhari, Chandmas, Sundartola and Kandagi Tehsil area in Balaghat. There are 150 villages in Tumsar Tehsil. As per the census 2001, the total population of Bhandara district was 1136146 souls, out of which 573445 were men and 562701 were women. 84.5% of people are residing in rural area and 15.5% of people are residing in urban area. As per

the census 2001, the density of population was 606 persons per sq.km. About 78% of people are educated in the district. Most of the people in the area are depending upon farming, however some of the villagers carry out the business of poultry farm, fishing as well as laboring. The educational facilities are good, but the medical facilities are not sufficient in the area.

Environment Monitoring Plan : In this plan, the frequency of monitoring of PM_{10} , $PM_{2.5}$, SO_2 & NO_x in ambient air will be monthly. The Generator Sets and stacks are monitored at 3 locations within the distance of 100 – 200 mtr. and at 2 locations near the control systems. The noise level is monitored at a distance of 100 – 200 mtr. from the Generator Set and Treatment System and at 2 locations near the treatment system. The water quality (ground water and surface water) has been monitored monthly at 3 locations and at the wells situated near treatment system as per the CPCB norms. The frequency of ETP will be weekly as per the CPCB norms. The soil testing will be carried out monthly for the parameters pH, Humidity, Organic Matters, SAR, CEC, Chloride, Nitrogen, Phosphorous, Flouride, Sulphur, etc. at one location in the area of treatment system and at 2 locations within the distance of 200 mtr.

While briefing about Environment Monitoring Plan, **Shri Goyanka** further stated that the main sources of air pollution are stack attached to the furnaces/bhattis and for control of the same, they have installed wet scrubbers (2 NOs.), bag filter and spraying arrangement. The expected pollutant are Particulate Matter, PM_{10} , $PM_{2.5}$, SO_2 and NO_x and the source of the same is generator set. The grinding mill will be operated in a closed circuit with fine dust collection arrangement. The dust collector contains 54 Nos. of bag filters and the dust collectors are also provided with additional G.P. sheets so that no dust will be emitted.

Control of Manganese Hazard : There is no any Manganese hazard during the operation and handling process. However, there will be Manganese Hazard only after eating the Manganese in big quantity. The Manganese grinding is carried out in closed circuit, which is provided with fine dust collection system due to which there will be no any dust emission. Water spraying arrangement will be provided at road and construction area so as to control the dust emission. The workers will be provided with protective equipments. Due to the transportation of raw material in solid form by truck covered with tarpaulin and finished goods packed in HDPE bags, there will be no possibility of dust emission. Tree plantation is done at the plant sides which will help in controlling the dust emission.

Water Pollution Control System : The waste water generated from washing of minerals is collected in settling tank and again recycled. The waste water generated from cooling section is collected into the tank and thereafter is used in cooling tower and then again recycled. The sludge generated from washing cradle is collected in settling tank and again recycled. Safety measures and adequate infrastructures are provided at construction area and residence of workers.

Domestic Effluent Generation & Management : At present, the domestic effluent generation is $0.4 M^3/day$ and after expansion, it will be $0.8 M^3/day$, which will be treated into septic tank and then soaked into pit.

Industrial Effluent & Management : After expansion, the effluent generation from washing of minerals will be **0.5 M³/day**, which will be collected in settling tank and then recycled in the process. The water required for the cooling purpose will be **0.2 M³/day**, the effluent generated from cooling section will be again subjected to cooling tower for reuse, it means **100%** of effluent will be recycled in the process.

Solid Waste Management : About **50** Tons of solid waste, i.e. debris. will be generated during the construction phase of the project and same will be used for leveling the roads as well as land filling. Scrap generation will be **5** Ton, which will be collected and sold to the scrap dealer. The other solid waste generated from the process will be **80** Ton, which will either be recycled in the process or sold out.

Rain Water Harvesting & Management Plan : The rain water will be collected in the tank and then it will be transferred to the bore well/recharge pits by gravitational force. The proposed rain water storage capacity is **15600** cu.m. and the total surface run off will be about **118.08** cu.m. for which **8** Nos. of recharge pits having the size of **3.0 m x 3.0 m x 3.0 m** are proposed. The total annual rain water stored will be **114113.50** cu.m. In this plan, the rain water collected will be used for gardening/irrigation purpose after necessary treatment.

Green Belt Development : They have reserved about **5241.0** sq.m. of land for the green belt development, roads and pavement. It has been proposed to carry out the plantation at the boundary of the project. For the development of green belt, various plant species, viz. Pimpal, Khair, Babhul, Palas, Teak, Mango, Niligiri, etc. will be planted.

Budget Estimate for the Environment Management : **Shri Goyanka** briefed about the proposed expenditure towards Environment Management and stated that existing water pollution control system will be used for which the annual recurring expenditure will be Rs. **1.0** Lac. The budget provision for the air pollution control system is Rs. **10.0** Lacs and the annual recurring expenditure for the same will be Rs. **1.0** Lac. The existing noise level control system and infrastructure will be used. For the storage of water (Rain Water Harvesting), the budget provision of Rs. **10.0** Lacs is made and the annual recurring expenditure for the same will be Rs. **0.50** Lac. The existing storm water drain will be used and the annual recurring expenditure for the same will be Rs. **1.0** Lac. The budget provision made for the landscaping is Rs. **2.0** Lacs and the annual recurring expenditure of the same is Rs. **1.0** Lac., i.e. the total budget provision made towards Environment Management is Rs. **22.00** Lacs and the annual recurring expenditure is of Rs. **4.5** Lacs. Thereafter, **Shri Goyanka** concluded the power point presentation of their proposed project.

During the course of public hearing, the public participants raised certain questions related to the said project and same were answered by the Project Proponents as below :

1. **Shri Yuvraj Raut**, the Ex. Sarpanch of village Paonarkhari, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara stated that the proposed project is good. Due to establishment of proposed project, employment will be made available to the local people and they do not have any trouble due to the said project.

2. **Shri Vilas Uchibagale**, the Dy. Sarpanch of village Pawnarkhari, Tq. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara expressed similar views as stated by **Shri Raut** and requested that the people in the area shall get the employment due to the proposed project.
3. **Smt. Mangala Pusam**, a resident of nearby village Paonarkhari T. Tumsar, Dist: Bhandara stated that get the job due to the said project and also get an advance on account of medical treatment as and when required. She stated that they do not have any trouble due to the said project.
4. **Shri Rahul Wankhede**, Field Officer of MPCB, Bhandara stated that the public participants may express their views, objections, problems, etc. prior to conclude the meeting. He further stated that, if the people and their children in the area are affecting due to the said project or something is required from the industrialist for the Grampanchayat, such issues may be expressed as the Sub-Divisional Officer pointed out that there is Corporate Social Responsibility Cell in the said project.
5. **Shri Milind Bansod**, the Chairman of Public Hearing Panel & the Additional Collector, Bhandara pointed out that the Project Proponent has not briefed about the Corporate Social Responsibility during the presentation. **Shri Lalit Goyanka**, the Project Director clarified that they have made the provision of Rs. 5.0 Lacs for the CSR and the said CSR has been decided by their Secretary who is sitting at Nagpur. The responsibility of CSR will be of the person who will be the Director, Manager of the said project and such persons will be responsible for the verification of the same and the requirements of the people in the village under CSR will be considered by the Director of the project. The **Hon. Chairman** suggested that as a Corporate Social Responsibility, the issues regarding development of roads, road lights, medical facilities, school, etc. shall be decided in consultation with the concerned Grampanchayat, authorities, viz. Sarpanch, etc. He further asked about the shareholders of the company alongwith their names and number of people from village Paonarkhari employed in the company, upon which **Shri Lalit Goyanka** stated that he himself Shri Lalit Goyanka, Smt. Sarita Goyanka and Shri Manish Goyanka are the Directors of the company and other 25 – 26 persons are the shareholders residing at different locations those have given their contribution. The total shares (*Bhagbhandwal*) of the company is Rs. 10.0 Lacs. At present 18 persons are employed in the company and after expansion 18 persons will be employed. Besides this, 15 persons will be given indirect employment and other 50 to 60 persons will get the work due to the transportation activity, etc.

The Hon. Chairman further stated that the Project Proponent has briefed about the details of dust emission, water consumption, impact of proposed project on the environment and the control measures to be taken thereof and further the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board will monitor the same. He further asked about the area of the land where the company is located, upon which **Shri Goyanka** replied that total land available is 1.76 hectares, i.e. 17000 sq.m. **The Chairman** asked whether the land is private, then **Shri Goyanka** clarified that it is his own land. **The Chairman** stated that the land is not a Government land, but there are nallas and nalla water will enter into the said land, then whether the nallas will be closed or otherwise. Then, **Shri Goyanka**

clarified that whatever the rain water will flow into the nallas will be collected and stored. **The Chairman** asked from where the nalla flows, then, **Shri Goyanka** stated that the said nalla flows along their land and further meets to lake. There is a State Highway near to their land and the said nalla meets to the lake located near their village by crossing the State Highway. **Shri G.P. Ambule**, Patwari pointed out that there is a private land at Gat No. 329 & 334 at the East and West side of Gat No. 330, where there is no any nalla located. .

The Chairman asked whether the generated from the process will be again recycled in the ore (process), then, **Shri Manish Goyanka** the Project Proponent clarified that such water is collected in the tanks containing manganese grains through high discharge pumps and after settling the manganese grains, the said water is recycled totally (100%). He stated that they have provided 2 tanks, i.e. one is settling tank and another filter water tank. After 100% recycling, the sludge remained in the tank contains 25% of Manganese, which is their basic raw material. Further, through briquette process, Manganese Oxide is prepared and same is disposed by selling it to the Silicon Manganese industries located in the nearby area because the sludge of Manganese is their basic raw material. **The Chairman** asked whether necessary permissions are obtained for this project. **Shri Manish Goyanka** stated that they have obtained necessary permissions, but the Environmental Clearance is new and same is yet to be obtained. The other permissions from the concerned departments viz. Indian Bureau of Mines (IBM), DGM, etc. are also taken.

Thereafter, **The Chairman**, of Public Hearing Panel & the Additional Collector, Bhandara again asked the public participants that if anybody is having any doubt, suggestion, objection, views, etc. same can be expressed.

6. **Smt. Kantabai Babane**, one of the public participants stated that the people in the area say that they do not have any trouble due to the said project and she also opined that the proposed project shall be established in the area.

Shri N.H. Shivangi, Regional Officer, MPCB, Nagpur & Member of Public Hearing Panel stated that the information about the proposed project was briefed before the public participants, objections were placed, environmental problems were asked, upon which it has been told that there is no any trouble due to the said project, but he would like to tell the public participants that this is the Public Hearing. The Maharashtra Pollution Control Board will grant the permission only after getting the Environmental Clearance from the Central Government to the said project. Even after getting the Environmental Clearance, the water pollution control system, air pollution control system, noise pollution control system, etc. will be monitored by MPCB and then permission will be granted otherwise no. This Public Hearing is conducted here so as to get the Environmental Clearance to the said project. He said that he is thankful to the Additional Collector, Sub-Divisional Magistrate and all the public participants for extending their co-operation.

Shri L.S. Bhad, Convener of Public Hearing & Sub-Regional Officer, MPCB, Bhandara stated that the people in the area attended the Public Hearing of M/s. Paonarkhari Minereals &

Chemicals Pvt. Ltd. and extended their co-operation. He said that he is thankful to all the public participants and then concluded the public hearing.

Lastly, the Public Hearing ended with a vote of thanks to the **Chair**.

(N.H. Shivangi)
Member &
Regional Officer,
MPCB, Nagpur.

(Milind Bansod)
Chairman &
Additional Collector,
Bhandara.

(L.S. Bhad)
Convener &
Sub-Regional Officer,
MPCB, Bhandara.