

MINUTES OF ENVIRONMENTAL PUBLIC HEARING

MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC HEARING OF PROPOSED EXPANSION FOR SUGAR UNIT FROM 4000 TCD to 8250 TCD AND CO GENERATION UNIT FROM 21 MW TO 35 MW OF THE MALEGAON SAHAKARI SAKHAR KARKHANA LIMITED, AT. POST – SHIVNAGAR, TAL.- BARAMATI, DIST – PUNE.

The public hearing was conducted for expansion of existing sugar from 4,000 TCD to 8,250 TCD and cogeneration unit from 21 MW to 35 MW of M/s The Malegaon Sahakari Sakhar Karkhana Limited, At.Post – Shivnagar, Tal.- Baramati, Dist – Pune on 04th December, 2018 at the site.

Following were the panel members as per Board's Office Order No. E-105 of 2018 under letter no. BO/JD (WPC)/PH/B- 4465, dated 26-11-2018 :-

- 1) Dr. Mrs. Jayashree Katare -Chairman,
Addl. District Magistrate, Pune
(Representative of District Magistrate,
Pune)

- 2) Shri Nitin Shinde, - Convener
Sub Regional Officer, Pune-I,
MPCB, Pune

Shri.Nitin Shinde, Convener of the Public Hearing Committee and Sub Regional Officer, Pune-I, MPCB, Pune welcomed Hon'ble Chairman of the public hearing committee, company officials and public who were present in large number. He informed that as per the EIA Notification of Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Govt. of India, (i.e. MoEFCC, GoI) dated 14th September, 2006 as amended on 1st December, 2009, it is mandatory to conduct prior public consultation to certain projects which are covered in the schedule of the said Notification. The Sub Regional Office, Pune-I, MPCB, Pune was in receipt of application of M/s The Malegaon Sahakari Sakhar Karkhana Limited, At.Post – Shivnagar, Tal.- Baramati, Dist – Pune for proposed expansion of sugar unit from 4,000 TCD to 8,250 TCD and Co-Generation Unit from 21 MW to 35 MW at the existing site of the industry.

Further, the Convener informed that, as per EIA Notification, 2006 sugar industry is placed in 5 (j) category and Co-Generation is placed in 1 (d). The aim of conducting prior public consultation is to aware, local people who can be participant in the hearing and they should know the developmental activities and Environment Management Plan of the unit.

The convener of the meeting informed that as per the said EIA Notification, the sugarcane crushing capacity more than 5,000 TCD comes under Category B and the Co-Generation project of the proposed capacity comes under Category B. Hence the project proponent had submitted online prescribed application along with pre-feasibility report to the Gov. of Maharashtra Environment Dept. Mantralaya, Mumbai for Terms of Reference (ToR) of EIA studies on 11th May, 2018. Gov. of Maharashtra Environment Dept. SEAC, Mumbai considered the project and approved the ToR on 11th July, 2018. As per said Notification, 30 days' advance public notice was published in the local newspaper "Loksatta" in Marathi on 01/11/2018 and in English daily "Indian Express" on 01/11/2018. The public were appealed to send their suggestions or objections regarding the proposed expansion project.

Also a copy of EIA report and executive summary were made available at various offices of Government i.e. Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Western Zone Office, Nagpur; District Magistrate Office, Pune, Additional District Magistrate Office, Pune, Zilla Parishad Office, Pune, District Industries Centre Office, Pune, Tahsil Office- Baramati, Dist, Pune, Grampanchayat offices at Khandaj, Malegaon (BK), Malegaon (Kh), Pahunewadi, Dhurnalwadi, Tal – Baramati, Dist- Pune, Sub Regional Office, MPCB, Pune-I, Regional Office, MPCB, Pune and at Head Office of MPCB at Mumbai, Environment Department, Govt. of Maharashtra, Mumbai and on the website of MPCB. The public in general were appealed to send their suggestion or objection regarding the expansion of above project. The Convener further informed that one written suggestion on email is received by local MPCB Office, Pune supporting the expansion. He requested Hon'ble Chairman of the Committee for allowing to start the public hearing meeting.

Dr. Jayashree Katare, Chairman of Public Hearing Committee welcomed all and informed officials of the project to explain the project in details along with environment management plan of the project in local language Marathi. He also appealed general public to give objection / suggestion if any about the project after technical presentation.

The Environment Consultant appointed by the factory, gave the presentation of the expansion project. This presentation was comprised of information about the project in detail, probable impact of project activities and Environment Management Plan with respect to the same.

After the presentations, the Committee appealed gathering to give their suggestions or objections regarding the proposed expansion of the project, specifically concerned with environment.

THE DISCUSSIONS, QUESTIONS AND ANSWER ON THE TECHINCAL PRESENTAION OF THE PROJECT ARE AS FOLLOWS.

1. Shri Sopanrao Athule. At- Khandaj, Tal-Baramati, Dist-Pune

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/ Environment Consultant
1.	He raised the query on probable impact due to the expansion on local climate (air), particularly on crop, land and livestock.	Consultant explained that modeling has been done to estimate probable increase in the air pollutant concentration. The results of such study were explained i.e. considering existing and incremental concentration - probable level for PM(dust / pollutants) will be 76.527 and SOx will be 23.23 microgram per cum. The Concentration of pollutant will be under NAAQ standards which is 100 µ/m ³ for PM and 80 µ/m ³ for Sox. Hence, proposed expansion activity will not cause adverse impact on climate, crop, land and livestock
	He raised additional question on social & economy benefits after the proposed expansion of sugar and cogeneration unit	Proposed expansion of sugar unit will resolve the issue of excess cane availability. It will be crushed within time. The electricity available after meeting captive requirement will be sold to MSEB. It will helps to reduce the load shedding period. Overall, it will be possible to give more price to cane, This will increase economic growth of local people.

2. Shri Shreehari Yele, At.-Yelevasti, Malegaon, Tal.Baramati, Dist-Pune

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/ Environment Consultant
2.	After the expansion of factory which social changes / developments are likely to take place?	Consultant inform that, due to proposed expansion activity, almost 163 new direct employment will be generated. Apart from this indirect employment in the form of harvesting labour, transporters, etc. will get generated almost equivalent to existing requirement. Thus, employment will increase. This will

	helpful for development. Activities such as schools, colleges, etc. are in place and providing its services to all locals residents
--	---

3. Mrs. Kishorsinha Krushnasinha Jadhav, At- Malegaon BK, Tal- Baramati, Dist-Pune

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
3.	While recruiting the staff, preference should be given to locals in the proposed expansion?	Managing Director assured that the factory has always given preference to local candidate. After proposed expansion, same strategy will be continued. However outside people may be appointed in exceptional circumstances for some specific technical requirements.

4. Shri Sandeep Vitthalrao Ghorapade At- Malegaon BK, Tal- Baramati, Dist-Pune

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent / Environment Consultant
4.	Is there any possibility of impact on crop due to proposed expansion activities? Presently, there are no adverse impact observed.	Consultant informed that, air and water pollution may occur after proposed expansion of sugar and cogeneration unit. There will be slightly increase in air pollution, however the air quality will be within the stipulated limits of NAAQS. Hence, it will not affect crops and other agricultural activity. The effluent will be treated to achieve standards prescribed by MPCB/CPCB. Hence it will not affect crop and soil.

5. Shri Vikram Jagtap At.- Pandare, Tal- Baramati, Dist-Pune

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent / Environment Consultant
5.	Sulphur is used in the production of sugar. Does it have any effect	Consultant explained that, All over India the Sulphur is used for

	on human health?	the production of crystal white sugar. It is mandatory to every industry to maintain a concentration of Sulphur in sugar as prescribed standards by FDA/FSSAI. Thus, the factory analyzer its sugar samples from third party (NABL approved) laboratory, time to time. Hence, sugar produced by the sulphitation process does not have any effect on human health.
--	------------------	--

6. Mrs. Hemant Kate At.Post – Malegaon, Tal.- Baramati, Dist-Pune

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent / Environment Consultant
6.	He opened that, as a mentioned in the map shown by the consultant, almost 80% of land is occupied by the sugar cane crop. Hence proposed expansion activities is essential for us. Karkhana has existing ESP as a air pollution and 76 m stack height, now a day there is no any issues regarding air pollution. He strongly supported for the proposed expansion activity.	The Management expressed sincere thanks for his support.

7. Mrs. H. Madhu Babu Hyderabad, NGO.

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
7.	He has given support to proposed expansion activity and handed over a letter (giving some suggestions) to Chairman in hard copy	Noted.

8. Shri. Nanasaheb Mokashi At.- Katphal, Tal.- Baramati, Dist-Pune.

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
8.	He raised a question about	Consultant informed that,

	<p>water management and planning for the proposed expansion activity.</p>	<p>fresh water requirement is mainly at startup. Cane itself has 70% of water, about 85-90% of which will be recycled for various requirement of manufacturing process. However, excess condensate to the extent of about 1609 cum per day will be available even after recycling. Fresh water requirement will be in the form of makeup water for boiler. As water converted into steam and steam is condensed. During this process about 4-5% of water loss takes place. Another requirement of fresh water is for domestic purpose. Fresh water of about 182 cum will be required for day-to-day operations of the factory during the season.</p>
--	---	--

9. Shri. Vikram Jagatap At.- Malegaon BK, Tal. Baramati, Dist. Pune.

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
9.	<p>He raised a question related to the chemicals used in the process and ETP operations. He asked whether the factory considers the organic and inorganic components gets released in the wastewater during operation of ETP?</p>	<p>Consultant explained that, organic and inorganic components are measured in the form of COD, BOD and TDS. The effluent is treated and disposed as per the guidelines and conditions issued by the Central Pollution Control Board and Maharashtra State Pollution Control Board, and it will be done so, even after expansion.</p> <p>The factory has installed a continuous effluent monitoring system for its ETP. This online system is connected to CPCB & MPCB server and results of outlet pollutant parameter (COD, BOD, TDS, TSS) are directly communicated (gets displayed) to CPCB & MPCB. In case of exceeding the limits of pollution parameters, CPCB /MPCB issues an alert message to the factory via email and SMS. Hence, this continuous monitoring of treated effluent helps to</p>

	follow the norms prescribed by the CPCB&MPCB.
--	---

10. Shri. Kokare At- Dhumalwadi, Tal. Baramati, Dist – Pune.

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
10.	Factory has total 179 acres of land and 35 acres of land occupied as a built-up area for sugar and allied unit, Whether greenbelt is 33% of 179 acres or 35 acres please clarify.	Consultant clarify that: Mentioned 12 acres green belts area is against built up area i.e. 35 acers. Because, the remaining land is occupied by non-industrial purpose such as colony, school, mangal karyalya (marriage hall) and collage etc.

11. Shri. Shivaji Sasate At. Pahunewadi, Tal. Baramati, Dist. Pune.

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
11.	Any new schemes/ facilities will be extended to the factory members, workers	Consultant explained the factory management is providing different services and facilities such as supply of organic bio-manure (as a brand name 'Sanjivani'), marriage hall (Shivthirth Managal Karyalaya), educational facilities, etc. to members as well as local residents. In addition it is providing technical guidance to farmers through technical experts etc. This work will be continued. It was also explained that the proponent has made a provision of Rs. 479 lakhs for CSR/CER activities. Which will be used in next five years and this will be beneficial to farmers, workers, members and local residents.

12. Shri. Vikram Jagtap, At.-Pandare, Tal.Baramati, Dist-Pune.

Sr.No.	Issue/Question Raised	Comments/Commitments made by Project Proponent/Environment Consultant
12.	He suggested to provide kutty machine for making powder of sugar cane trash as a part of	Cane development officer of Malegaon SSKL explained that, sugarcane trash is available to the

	preparation of manure	<p>extent of 3 to 5 tons per acre after harvesting of cane. This trash is beneficial for ratoon if managed properly. It saves water upto 50% by its proper use. However, it is observed that, many of the farmers are inclined towards making powder (kutti) of the trash. While doing this, the fertility of the soil gets affected due to moisture loss. More upon, the farmer uses the tractor exceeding the requirement. This factor also causes severe impact on soil. As a result the crop (ratoon) gets affected. The powder (kutti) reduces the water holding capacity of the soil. Thus, the crop start facing water shortage even if it is supplied and leaves turn yellow. Therefore, the factory management advices farmer for not to follow such practices. Instead, it recommends to use this trash to cover the soil and allow its slow degradation. It also prevents attack of pests. Water saving due to such process is beneficial a lot particularly in drought situation. Therefore, the factory is not encouraging for use of kutty machines.</p>
--	-----------------------	--

After this question answers, the Committee once again appealed the general public to give their suggestions or objections for proposed expansion project, particularly on environmental issues only.

The convener of the meeting appealed the Environmentalist who came from Hyderabad to attend the public hearing to express their views. They had submitted their suggestions by email and informed their likely attendance for the meeting. There was no response. The Committee asked project proponent and environment consultant of the project to answer the suggestions/comments received in writing. Mentioned to submit a copy of such reply to the local office of MPCB i.e. Sub Regional Office, Pune-I, MPCB, Pune, which will be submitted along with minutes of the meeting and final EIA report to the concerned authorities.

The Convener of the Environmental Public Hearing Committee gave some suggestions to the project proponent. They are as follows.

- a) Interlocking between pollution control systems and the process, if possible.
- b) It is suggested to use organic fertilizers for saline soil.

- c) If this factory is undergoing expansion, then the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board expects from the factory to use non-conventional sources such as wind energy, solar power as a role model for other factories of Maharashtra.

Hon'ble Chairman of the Public Hearing Committee gave following suggestions to the project proponent.

- a) The factory should work to create maximum employment and see how the local people will benefitted from it, as its social commitment.
- b) The Factory management must ensure that CSR funds should get utilized properly and mostly for local farmers and members of the factory.

The Public Hearing Committee discussed the above mentioned points and directed the proponent to incorporate the same while preparing final EIA report.

The Public Hearing Committee informed that the suggestions, objections raised during the meeting will be incorporated in the minutes of the meeting. It will be submitted to the concerned authority along with final EIA report. The Expert Committee will take further decision. It was observed that public was not raising any queries further or raising any issues. Hence, the convener of the Committee requested the Chairman to conclude the meeting.

While concluding the meeting the Chairman informed that the hearing attended by 80 persons, includes general public, government officials and project officials and announced that the meeting is closed. The meeting ended with extending thanks to the Chair.


(Nitin Shinde)

Convener of the Public Hearing Committee and
Sub Regional Officer, Pune- I, MPCB,
Pune


(Dr. Jayashree Katare)

Chairman of the Public Hearing Committee
and
Additional District Magistrate, Pune, Dist-Pune

