

Minutes of Environmental Public Hearing

of

M/s. Karan Sugars Pvt. Ltd.,

Gat No. 487/488 A/2 488 A/3, Herwad,

Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur

Held on 23-5-2012 at 11.00 AM at Karkhana site,

Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

M/s. Karan Sugars Pvt. Ltd. has submitted the proposal to the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board for proposed expansion of existing 30 KLPD cane juice based distillery to 100 KLPD molasses based distillery at Gat No. 487/488 A/2 488 A/3, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur. In this regard, M.P.C. Board has conducted the environmental public hearing on 23-5-2012 at 11.00 A.M. at the Karkhana site, Herwad. Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur. During the public hearing, the following public hearing panel members were present.

1. Shri Tushar Thombare, .. Chairman
S.D.O., Ichalkaranji, Dist: Kolhapur.
(Representative of District Collector)
2. Shri. A.B. Durgule, .. Convener/
Sub Regional Officer, Member
I/C. Regional Officer, M.P.C. Board,
Kolhapur.
(Representative of M.P.C. Board)

Shri Amar Durgule, Convener of public hearing has welcomed the committee members, local villagers, N.G.Os. etc. & with the due permission of the Chairman, the work of public hearing proceeded. He explained that as per the notification of 2006 of MOEF, Government of India, New Delhi, the molasses based distillery project has to obtain environment clearance. In this regard M/s. Karan Sugars Pvt. Ltd. has applied for the environment clearance to MOEF, Govt. of India, New Delhi for the proposed expansion project of 30 KLPD cane juice distillery to 100 KLPD molasses based distillery. The MOEF has issued TOR with certain terms and conditions to the project proponent and also to prepare EIA/EMP report as the notification 2006 and to conduct public hearing about the project. The proposal of this public hearing was submitted to MPC Board on 13.3.2012. After that the District Collector, Kolhapur decided to held public hearing on 23 5 2012

M.P.C. Board has published advertisement in local newspaper in Pudhari on 21.4.2012 in Marathi and in Times of India on 22.4.2012 in English language one month before. The draft copy of environment impact assessment report as submitted by the project proponent pertaining to this project was placed in the offices of District Collector, Kolhapur, Zill Parishad, Kolhapur, District Industries Center, Kolhapur, Tahasil Office, Herwad, Grampanchayat office, Herwad, Office of the MPC Board at Mumbai, Regional Office, MPCB, Kolhapur & Environment Department, Mantralaya, Govt. of Maharashtra, Mumbai so as to have access to the concerned public for referring the details of Public Hearing documents and were requested to file their objections / suggestions / views etc. He informed that the participant who wants to submit their suggestions/objections can submit the same after the presentation of the project proponent. The minutes of the public hearing will be submitted to the government. The role of this committee is recording objections, questions, suggestions, queries of the public and submitting to the government. With the due permission of the Chairman, he requested the project proponent to give their presentation regarding the proposed project.

The Technical advisor of M/s. Karan Sugars Pvt. Ltd. Shri. Gajare gave presentation with the help of slide show including introduction, study of environment, map of proposed project, land available for the proposed project, manufacturing process, expansion investment, available molasses, steam and energy generation, solid waste management, water demand, air pollution control plan, primary study, noise levels monitoring, ground water analysis results, soil analysis report, environmental impact, environment management plan, green belt development etc.

Then after the presentation, the Chairman of the committee asked the public to raise their question/suggestions if any regarding the proposed project. He informed that the minutes of the public hearing will be submitted to the government.

Que. Shri Bhupal Ramu Chougule, A/p. Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

We do not know about the project. We must think about effect of this proposed project on our agriculture land, air, water etc. The earlier management who has implemented the project has given some false commitment and there are problems with our well water in the nearby area and causes bad smell to the drinking water also. The waste water from the project will cause same problems there will be drinking water problems to our farm labors, no implementation of water treatment plant and will

damage our agricultural land so we oppose the project and I do not want this project.

Ans -

Dr. U. K. Sharma, Chief Consultant of the proposed project informed that what happened 5 years back will not happen now because management & technology are changed now. Before this government has a question about what to do for controlling molasses generated from sugar factories. To overcome this problem the Govt. has decided to install distillery projects. Hence the distilleries are the proper solutions for the processing of molasses. Earlier the molasses was stored in kachha lagoons from which it percolates and causes soil and ground water pollution in the surround area which persists for many years.

The waste water generated from the distilleries is required huge land for disposal and causes pollution problems. Considering the pollution problem many R & D's were carried out through which few technologies were proven and spent wash concentration and incineration is one of them. This is one of the best advance technology as and there are very few industries who have implemented such technology in the country. We are going to spend about Rs. 5 crores for spent wash treatment equipments with the evaporation system and the reoccurring cost of burning of concentrated spent wash generated is about Rs.75 lacs at the time of operation of this project and for safe disposal of molasses based distillery waste water.

Regarding as you say that there will be problems with air pollution into surrounding area, we are proposing to provide 35 mtrs. of stack height with dust collection system to the boiler to mitigate the air pollution problems. As we propose to reduce the fuel quantity from 270 MT/day to 80 MT per day by burning the concentrated spent wash by mixing with the bagasse as well as recovering biogas 26000 nm³/day in biodigester. The treated water will be reused in to the process hence the water requirement will be less and the generation of effluent will be less. If the daily water requirement is 20 lac liters it will reduce to 8 lac liters hence the 12 lac liters of fresh water will saved. As the quantity of fuel used will be reduced then the air pollution also reduces. This project will be implemented with cooperation of villagers

The Chairman of the committee Shri Tushar Thombare told to the technical expert that you are implementing the 100 KL molasses based project. But the villagers want to know what the project is and what will be

generation from the project in simple way. They want to know what spent wash is and where it will be generated.

U.K.Sharma explained we all know how butter is produced by fermentation of milk in our home. After taking out the butter buttermilk remains. Similarly after extracting alcohol by converting glucose of molasses into alcohol, the spent wash remains. Spent wash is residue after alcohol is separated from molasses.

In response to question that only liquor will be produced from alcohol Dr U K Sharma detailed different uses of the alcohol other than the potable liquor. It is used in medicines, soap, colours detergent manufacturing and blending with petrol, and not only for manufacturing of liquor purposes only. To use this rectified spirit in the liquor there are certain treatments that has to be done as this spirit can not consumed directly as liquor.

Alleging fears of local public about possibility of pollution due to percolation of molasses Dr Shrama explained molasses will be safely stored in steel tanks before processing. It will be diluted with water mixed with yeast which will decompose molasses. The impurities consisting chemicals that were added during the sugar manufacturing and other material will be removed. Then distillation will be carried out to separate alcohol and colour.

The waste water (spent wash) generated from the process, is acidic in nature it contain the chemical mixed during the sugar manufacturing process. It will be treated in five stage multi effective evaporator in this process the condensate water will be reused in process again and again. In this way the quantity of fresh water consumption will reduce. This concentrated spent waste will be used as fuel by mixing it with the bagasse to reduce the fuel consumption. Spent wash is nothing but the remains that are mixed during the sugar manufacturing process. It will be evaporated into the multi effect evaporation system and the concentrated slurry from the multiple effect evaporation system, dried and will be burned in boiler as fuel.

Clarifying how spent wash causes pollution Dr Sharma informed that the spent wash if discharged without treatment in water will causes oxygen deficiency to the aquatic life if it mixed with water body. It is acidic in nature it contain the chemical mixed during the sugar manufacturing process.

Shri Bhupal Chougule told that only false commitment has been given, no implementation is carried out same commitment has given by the earlier project proponent.

Ans –

Dr Sharma clarified it is duty of project proponent to ensure implementation of treatment facilities as per commitment.

Que. Shri Pradeep Chougale, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

Since the earlier project in operation there was problem of flies which causes problems to the labours working in the farm. There will be water pollution in the agricultural land.

Ans –

Dr. Sharma explained that in proposed project we are using such a most modern technique which will ensure no effluent discharge and the question of discharge of effluent outside the factory do not arises even upto the boundary wall of the factory the effluent will not reach. For the smell problems will not be there as we will not carry out aerobic process in open tanks and all our process processing will be done in closed vessels.

Shri Chougule was not convinced and told that these are false commitment no implementation will take place the problems of pollution will be created and I m opposing the project.

One of the villager told that if the project has got the sanction and there are problems of pollution then who will be responsible and who will give the compensation.

Ans : If project proponent creates pollution he will be responsible.

Que. Shri Jingonda Patil, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

We have well. Due to proposed project our agriculture will be damaged. Hence, I oppose the project. I will fast against this project.

Que. Shri Dilip Patil, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

If the borewell water, well water quality and land quality change due to the proposed project, we will not do anything

Que. Shri Suhas Birnale, Akiwat, Dist: Kolhapur.

In this project the all spent wash will be treated and destroyed. If the project is implemented there will be generation of job and about 70 people get the job and their families will survive. So the project shall be implemented.

Que. Shri Rashid Jamadar, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

The village people from Herwad will get the jobs. The project proponent shall take care that there should not be pollution problem in the area care shall be taken.

Que. Shri Mahadev Balasaheb Waghe.

The villagers have had given permission earlier to the project now; why they are opposing the project now we don't know. If the factory is not implemented then there will be loss to the village. The jobs will be lost so the project should be implemented.

Que. Shri Balgonda Patil, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

There will be about 13.5 T of fly ash generation and you have informed that you are going to manufacture the bricks from it. Where the bricks will be manufactured and when it will be manufactured is not mentioned in the report.

Dr. U. K. Sharma explained that we have mentioned that there will be about only 3.5 MT/day of fly bottom ash generation. We will not manufacture bricks here. The brick manufacturers will manufacture bricks and those people will collect the ash and manufacture the good quality of bricks from the ash. We will sell this ash after the project starts.

Shri Patil informed that the waste water and molasses water will spread in surrounding area. The historical monument Khidrapur is about 7 K.M. from the project. In the presentation, it has mentioned that there is no historical place and forest in 10 K.M areas from the factory. There is social forestry activity near the area and trees were planted.

Ans: The chairman of the committee told that the distance from historical place and forest is related with the concern department and their opinion will be taken .

Shri Patil said that the consultant of project proponent informed that samples of well water has taken. If it is taken, inform the name of the well, name of well owner, 7/12, gat no. of land. Project proponent has not taken samples. The consent of well owner was not obtained. Due to this project there will increase of transportation, it will create noise and air pollution. In the presentation, the distance from Panchaganga river basis is mentioned 5 Km. but air distance is only 1.5 km. The high tide line of the river is about 1000 ft from the project. The project is located at a height of 46 feet from the village and the land structure is a barren land. The water will be percolated and problems will be created. The water table level of well in Herwad village is about 20-25 feet and hence, if the waste water is used for irrigation there will be chances of contamination of well water.

Herwad grampanchayat temple is about is 500 mtrs. distance. People who will come here will 100% face problems of this project. Nearest city is Kurundwad 4km air 8 km not Shirol. It is municipal council. Consultant said that there are 300 trees planted but there is not single tree. The distance of M/s. Datta SSK Ltd. 16 km road, M/s. Gurudattta SSK Ltd. 6 km shown in the presentation is wrong. Hence, we oppose the proposed project.

Que. Shri Ramgonda Jingonda Patil.

The earlier project is not related with us since we have taken over in 2006. The water samples were collected and reports are there. Trees were planted.

Que. Shri Pradip Chougule, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

Earlier the villagers drinks the well water. But now they have stopped the drinking of well water. The waste water is discharged outside and finds its way in agriculture land. We have already given complaint about the same.

There will be pollution problem. He also mentioned that the consultant of the project proponent informed that there will be no air pollution problem beyond 1 K.M. from the project, then what about the villagers who are within 1 KM. distance.

Que. What is the meaning of bio diversity ?

Ans. Shri Durgule told that trees, birds, animals etc. comes in bio diversity.

Que. How the waste water will burn ?

Dr. Sharma told that from the spent wash generated in the distillery and methane gas will be recovered and burnt in boiler and the condensate water from MEE will be recovered and remaining concentrated spent wash will be burnt in boiler with bagasse.

If there are minor mistakes in EIA report regarding distance of sugar mill, name of nearest city etc it will be corrected. This is draft EIA report and we will do corrections in the same. Shri Chougule told that after carrying out corrections in the draft EIA, public hearing should be taken once again. The chairman of public hearing informed that this is the draft EIA report and you can point out the problems of the project to the government. For that purpose, the today's public hearing is conducted.

Shri. Chougule asked question where the spent wash will be stored. Dr. Sharma informed that the spent wash will be stored in steel tanks as per the guidelines of CPCB. Shri Chougule told that due to the waste water of this project there will impact on bio diversity. Animals living in water like snakes and other creatures etc. will be dead within one hour. This waste water is also damaged to sugarcane crops earlier. This water is danger for human life.

Que. Shri Amol Vikas, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

If we oppose the proposed project, there will no development of the region.

Que. Shri Mahesh Patil, Sainik Takali, Dist: Kolhapur.

The earlier project is for manufacture of ethanol from sugarcane. Now why you change the project to manufacture ethanol from molasses. There are air pollution problems from nearby sugarcane factories. Such type of project shall be implemented in the MIDC area or Lote Parshuram chemical zone.

Ans.

Dr. Sharma informed that the company will provide dust collector to control ash. Shri Patil told that M/s. Gurudatta SSK Ltd. has explained that there will not be air pollution. But their ash causes pollution problems. Dr. Sharma told that of dust collector is not working efficiently and causes air pollution. I assure that we will provide dust collector and there will be no air pollution due to proposed project. If the pollution is not stopped after providing dust collector, it is negligence.

Que. Shri Pradip Chougule, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

In this land area there is chloride and sulphate. What is the meaning of it. Survy has carried out for the company and not for the village. Three parts of this area are polluted. This is only non polluted area. This area should not be polluted. What is the meaning of information of noise pollution given in the presentation.

Que. Shri Desai, Sarpanch, Grampanchayat, Herwad, Tal: Shirol, Dist: Kolhapur.

The company should clear the objections raised by the villagers in this public hearing. The company should comply all the laws and considering the local conditions it should implement. This is my demand as first citizen of this village.

The Hon'ble Chairman Shri. Tushar Thombare told that all the objections raised in this public hearing are recorded and also video recording is carried out. It will be recorded in the minutes of the public hearing and submitted to government for further necessary action. He thanked the villages for asking questions and their cooperation and the public hearing ended vote of thanks.

There are four written representations in support of the proposed project and two written representations against the proposed project. The copies of the same are enclosed herewith.

Shri Tushar Thombare,
Chairman,
Sub Divisional Officer, Ichalkaranji,
Dist: Kolhapur.
(Representative of District Collector,
Kolhapur).

Shri Amar B. Durgule,
Convener, Sub Regional
Officer, I/c. Regional Officer,
MPC Board, Kolhapur.
(Representative of MPCB)