

**Minutes of Public Hearing conducted on 01.12.2018 in respect of M/s Sahakar Maharshi Shivajirao Narayanrao Nagawade Sahakari Sakhar Karkhana Ltd., Shrigonda for 26 MW Co-Generation Plant under the Chairmanship of Honorable Mr. Prashant Patil, Residential Additional District Collector, Ahmadnagar.**

The Public Hearing has been fixed in respect of M/s Sahakar Maharshi Shivajirao Narayanrao Nagawade Sahakari Sakhar Karkhana Ltd., Shrigonda for 26 MW Co-Generation Plant on 01.12.2018 after expiry of 30 days period Public Hearing Notice under the Chairmanship of Honorable Mr. Prashant Patil along with P.M.Joshi, Regional Officer, MPCB, Nashik & Shri. A.V.Patil, Sub-Regional Officer, MPCB, Ahmadnagar, Panel Members.

About this Public Hearing notice was published in the Marathi Newspaper Dainik Lokmat dated : 01/11/2018 & English News Paper the Times of India dated 01/11/2018.

Following were the panel members as per Boards Office, Order No. E - 102 of 2018 under letter no. BO/JD(WPC)/PH/B-4323 dated : 14/11/2018.

- 1) Shri. Prashant Patil - Chairman  
Addl. District Magistrate, Ahmednagar, Residential Deputy Collector  
(Representative of District Magistrate, Ahmednagar)
- 2) Shri. P.M. Joshi - Member  
Regional Officer, MPCB, Nashik  
(Representative of MPCB, Mumbai)
- 3) Shri. Ajit V. Patil - Convener  
Sub Regional Officer,  
MPCB, Ahmednagar

Mr. Ajit Patil, the Sub-regional Officer, Ahmadnagar was directed by the Resident Additional District Collector after giving brief details of the Public Hearing to be conducted by & on behalf of MPCB, to introduce the public at large about the proposed project in short. He has given brief details thereof, inviting the farmer members, the nearby residents & public at large participated in the Public Hearing to submit written or oral objections or their suggestions as per the EIA Notification, 2006. He further informed that the requisite information was kept at various concerned public offices and thereafter 30 days public notice was given in the English & Marathi Newspapers & thereafter only the date of Public Hearing has been fixed as per provisions of the law. He informed that two written representations have been received by the MPCB. (Written Objection No. 1 - Dr. Vinaykumar Jathar, Shrigonda, Letter dated : 28/11/2018, Written Objection No. 2 - Shri. Karim Jahangir Shaikh, Ap. Shrigonda Factory - Letter dated : 28/11/2018)

After the welcome speech, Shri. Prashant Patil - Chairman Addl. District Magistrate, Ahmednagar Directed to the Project Proponent to start the Presentation.

Mr. Ramakant Naik, Managing Director along with the MoEF&CC, GoI – Approved Consultant M/s SGM Corporate Consultants Pvt. Ltd. , Pune (Now, M/s SGM Enviro (I) Pvt. Ltd.'s), Mr. B.B.Gunjaj, EIA Coordinator with the assistance of Mr. Sanjay Patil, Environment Coordinator have presented the proposal of 26 MW Co-Gen plant & also given necessary clarifications to the various issues & questions raised by the public participated in the Public Hearing.

Regional Officer MPCB, Nashik asked Mr. B.B.Gunjaj to clarify the difference between Consent conditions & Presentation, more particularly 53 CMD effluent/ water, the objections raised by Mr. Karim Jahangir Shaikh, the work of new boiler , the old temple in the said area & the objections to the land in the said area.

Shri. B.B.Gunjaj, Director of SGM Corporate Consultants, Pune has presented in depth aspects of proposed Co-Generation Plant. He had specifically presented the need of the project for sufficient power requirement of all the units of Cooperative Society of M/s Sahakar Maharshi Shivajirao Narayanrao Nagawade Sahakari Sakhar Karkhana Ltd., it's utilization for Captive use as well as further export of additional power to grid, which can be available to the nearby areas, the utilization of bagasse for proposed Co-Gen plant will further reduce the burden of handling & storage because of direct use thereof for Co-Gen, power generation will be with low cost and it will be for the development of rural area.

**The following objections / questions raised by the participants :-**

1. Mr. Appasaheb Baba Dhaigude, Handewadi : – What will be the benefit of new 26 MW Co-Gen Plant?
2. Mr. Mahesh Mohan Taware, Mathar Pimpri :- He told that his farm is adjoining the SSK and he is taking various crops like Sugarcane , Jawar etc. , but never his agricultural land or crops have been damaged.
3. Mr. Amol Sitaram, Salwe, Sarpanch, Limpangaon- The Karkhana organizes medical checkup , supplies filter water & during last 50 years , no adverse impact has been observed , on the contrary , the revenue of Grampanchayat has been considerably increased & if due to Co-Gen Plant benefits are likely to be there , we have no objection for new project. About 22,000/- Members of co-operative sugar factory are benefited and grampanchayat is also benefited.
4. Mr. Sudam Dnyandev Navale, Takali Kadawale :- Because of Sugar Complex , the village has been benefitted definitely. However what is likely impact may kindly be explained
5. Mr. Sanjay Eknath Nagawade, Wangdari :- He wanted to know the impact on water resources & air.
6. Mr. Mohitrao Vinayakrao Kurumbhkar, Limpangaon- Because of existing units , the employment has been available in the nearby area. But want to know what employment will be available to skilled & unskilled manpower ? If it is likely to be available, we do not have any objection
7. Mr. Arvind Vitthal Kapse :- If distillery was being operated on biogas , then why considerable period biogas was closed and only recently started , may be explained
8. Dr. Vinaykumar Jathar, Wadali, Shrigonda :- He has already given written complaint & wanted to place new objections , such as the Gat No.s of 81.99 Acres not given , the old temple at Limpangaon of 1861 not appeared to be in the EIA study , no mention of wildlife & Maldhok

bird restrictions. there is 81.99 Acre open space available with this sugar factory, out of that 33% space i.e. 27 Acre open space shall be tree planted but there is not a single tree planted by this sugar factory. He insisted that before stating project tree plantation should be done & then only permission can be considered

9. Mr. Pramod Vasant Ghate, Limpangaon - My agricultural land is at G.No. 52/1, Hissa No. 43 at Limpangaon. This sugar factory is only making profit. we don't have good water to drink. I have dug one well but polluted water was noticed. This Sugar Factory has done illegal encroachment and fixed wire compound. My 2 acre agriculture land has gone in to this encroachment. The encroachment on his field wanted to be removed & the well water to be tested. He has also made a police complaint in a police station about encroachment. Regional Officer, Nashik told that the encroachment is not in the purview of Public Hearing , but he can take civil or criminal action if he has any grivience about the same.
10. Adv. Samit Sayaji Borude, Shrigonda - The Ash generated from sugar factory causing environment pollution , his bore well has been polluted. The nearby Alcohol Bhattis , no actions are taken . On account of draught condition , the water requirement should be taken into consideration
11. Mr. Tukaram Yadu Shelar, Anghare :- I object the statement made by Adv. Amit Sayaji Borude. if a vehicle passess through a road then also dust emissions are noticed. I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
12. Mr. Karim Jahangir Shaikh - He wanted to take note of all his objections before granting any permission. He has given his written objection on 28/11/2018 about this project. He also stated that his mother & wife are suffering from kidney disease due to the polluted ground water of this sugar factory.
13. Mr. Nitin Appasaheb Wable, Mhatar Pimpri : - He himself & all other participants by raising their hands have given full support for the establishment of new 26 MW Co-Gen plant & stated that 99 % public wants the establishment of plant
14. Mr. Babu Appasaheb Wable, Madhe Vadgaon, :- I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project. This Factory has planted 600 trees in my village.
15. Mr. Appasaheb Goving Thite , Ghargaon : - I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project. I have worked for 40 years in this sugar factory but I have not observed any type of pollution. due to the Fly Ash of this factory nobody has Suffered.
16. Mr. Bapurao Pandhar, Inamgaon, Tal. Shirur, Dist. Pune : - I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project. From the Shirur Taluka 8 - 9 villages have became member of this co-operative Sugar Factory. This sugar factory has also co-operated in completing the bridge on River Ghod.
17. Mr. Ramesh Gaikwad, Chimbhale :- I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
18. Mr. Bapurao Kurumbhkar, Limpangaon :- I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project. My age is 64 years. whether 48% or 58% waste water is discharged ?
19. Mr. Hansraj Kharat, Anandwadi : - New boiler is required or not ? I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
20. Mr. Somnath Kurumbhkar, Limpangaon :- This 26 M. W Project is very good, I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
21. Mr. Arun Kshirsagar, Ajnuj :- This 26 M. W Project is very good, I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
22. Major. Changdeo Pachpute, Kashti :- My village is at 12 K.M. This Sugar Factory has planted 500 trees in my Village. I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.

23. Mr. Nanashaeb Zingale, Jangalewadi :- This waste water we are using for agricultural field & it seems to be good, I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
24. Mr. Dagdu Sonalkar, Vangdari Sarpanch : - Nobody has affected due to pollution, there is no pollution problem. I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
25. Mr. Bhausaheb Shinde (Mali), Pimpalgaon Pisa :- Electricity is only for 8 hours in our agricultural farm. we need electricity. I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
26. Mr. Babu Kshirsagar, Vangdari : - This Sugar factory has planted more than 3000 trees . I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
27. Mr. Prashant Darekar, Hiradgaon : - In the Periphery of 20 K.M. there is no MIDC Area. we have only this sugar factory, nobody has found Maldivian Bird in this area. This area doesn't come under eco-sensitive zone. There is no relation with the present drought situation. I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
28. Mr. Popat Borude, Shrigonda :- All the trees are giving fruit in this area. There is no pollution problem in this area, I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
29. Mr. Satish Bhujang Sudge, Limpangaon :- I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.
30. Mr. Bhagwan Kapse, Sarpanch, Pedgaon : - I Support this 26 M.W. Co-gen Project.

Mr. B.B.Gunjal & Mr. Ramakant Naik told that due to only industrial plants of SSK in that area , necessary employment has been created , the Karkhana has complied with all the environmental norms & therefore the permission may be granted at the earliest.

He has explained the difference between the Consent to Establish & the PPT submitted by the Project Proponent, pointing out that whatever changes are there, those will be rectified. As far as the complaint of Mr. Karim Jahangir Shaikh is concerned, the earlier old boilers are required to be replaced on account of its reduction in the efficiency & in order to adopt most advance the boiler along with air pollution control equipments. Because of proposed ESP installation, there will be further improvement in the air pollution control & reduction of Ash, thereby, there will be less air pollution or insignificant air pollution. The old temple in the said area will not be affected due to proposed Co-Gen Plant on account of installation of most advanced plant with the new boiler along with inbuilt air pollution control devices, besides proposed ESP. Out of 3,31,800 Sq.m. total land area, about 33 % area will be utilized for tree plantation/ Green Belt. Sufficient land is available with the Cooperative Sugar Factory. Mr. Gunjal further presented the details of approval for water with water requirement, process description along with major equipments & machineries with existing units & proposed Co-Generation Plant. He has also given brief details of environment surrounding Cooperative Plants including baseline study conducted between 1<sup>st</sup> March 2018 to 31<sup>st</sup> May 2018 in 10 Km radial distance around the project site, ambient air quality monitoring with reference to PM10, PM2.5 at 9 AAQM Stations along with concentration of CO, NH3 as per CPCB & MPCB norms. He has also given details of anticipated mitigation measures & monitoring program as well as risk assessment, disaster management plan, environment management plan & project benefits.

Mr. Ramakant Naik, MD informed that on account of non operation of distillery between 2014-2018, the boiler was not in operation. But now recently it has been started. Instead of existing 5 boilers, which have become old & their life is likely to come to an end, a new boiler for all the units together is being installed. The mentioning of 938 CMD is water consumption

& 53 CMD is proposed generation of effluent, which will be rectified wherever necessary. The unused land for which, the objection was taken, is in the possession of Sugar factory, District Collector has already given certificate to that effect & it is in the survey no. of Sugar factory.

Mr. B.B.Gunjral after giving clarification about all the questions raised by the complainants in the Public Hearing told that the Karkhana is having 22,733 members & its first season was in 1973-74, till date 44 crushing seasons have been carried out. The present capacity of Sugar Factory is 3500 TCD & it is going for expansion from 3500 to 4800 TCD, for which Consent to Establish has been granted & an application for Consent to Operate is submitted to the MPCB. The recovery of sugar is good. The sugar unit is having 81.99 Acres of land under its ownership, 33% is the green belt development area & 12 Acres of land has been made available for Co-Gen Plant. The unit has to make optimum use of the raw materials without use of coal & other natural raw material, thereby reducing pollution level. It will give maximum rate for sugarcane of farmer members. The proposed generation of electricity will be used for total Cooperative activities & additional electricity will be sold in grid. Hence an early approval of project is solicited.

About 400 persons/ representatives of public at large have been present in the Public Hearing. More than 30 participants have taken active part in asking various questions or giving their opinion about the proposed project. About 99% of the participants, who have taken active part along with others present in the Public Hearing strongly believed that because of proposed 26 MW Co-Gen plant, the residents will be benefitted. The income of the group of cooperative units will be increased, thereby the farmer members will be benefitted. They will get better price for sugarcane, in addition to existing best price is being given by the SSK. The Cooperative Sugar Factory will become self sufficient as far as the requirement of Electricity is concerned. Additional electricity will be sold to the grid for supply thereof to the nearby villages. Except 3-4 objections raised in the Public Hearing, the remaining participants expressed the views that Co-Generation plant is need of the time & they are fully supporting proposed 26 MW Co-Gen plant.

**During the proceeding and after the proceeding five letters in the support of this project were received on 01/12/2018, list as below :-**

1. Grampanchayat Office, Limpangaon, Tal. Shrigonda, Letter dated : 01/12/2018.
2. Grampanchayat Office, Vangdari, Tal. Shrigonda, Letter dated : 01/12/2018.
3. Rural Environment Education & Health Awareness Society (Reg.No. 1702/2007), Hyderabad letter dated 01/12/2018.
4. Safe Earth Foundation, Hyderabad (Reg.No. : 699/2010) letter dated : 01/12/2018.
5. Neethaa Swachanda Seva Soceity, Kurnool, Andhra Pradesh (Reg.No : KNL/1967/2017), Letter Dated : 01/12/2018.

**During the proceeding one letter stating objection for this project were was received on 01/12/2018 from Dr. Mr. Vinaykumar Jathar, Shrigonda, Dist. Ahmednagar.**

With the permission of the Chairman of the Public Hearing Committee to the conclude the meeting, Shri. P.M. Joshi, Member of the Public Hearing Committee informed that

suggestions, objections raised during the meeting will be incorporated in the minutes of the meeting and it will sent along with the EIA report and writing suggestions, objections, received during the meeting to the Expert committee of the Govt. Of Maharashtra. The Expert committee will take further decision. The Committee discussed about the points made in the presentation after detailed discussions, member of the Public Hearing committee asked Environment Consultant to rectify the discrepancies while preparing the final EIA report. Chairman of the committee informed that the technical issued raised during the hearing should be sorted and corrected while preparing final EIA report.


Additional District Collector expressed gratitude & satisfaction for the cooperation extended by the participants , the Project Proponent , Officers of the MPCB in conducting Public Hearing in the peaceful manner & declared that the Public Hearing is Concluded.

The Meeting ended extending thanks to the Chair.



(Shri. Prashant Patil)

Chairman of the Public Hearing Committee  
Addl. District Magistrate, Ahmednagar,  
(Representative of District Magistrate, Ahmednagar)



(Shri. P.M. Joshi)

Regional Officer, MPCB. Nashik  
Member of Public Hearing Committee



(Shri. Ajit V. Patil)

Convener of the Public Hearing Committee  
Sub Regional Officer, MPCB, Ahmednagar